

# N O R R A G   N E W S

NORTHERN POLICY, REVIEW, RESEARCH, AND ADVISORY  
NETWORK ON EDUCATION AND TRAINING (NORRAG)

NUMBER 22

January 1998

SPECIAL THEME

INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION

Editor

Kenneth King  
Editorial Address

Kenneth King, Centre of African Studies & Department of Education  
University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh EH8 9LL, Scotland UK  
Telephone (44) 0131 650 3879; telex 727442 unived G.  
Fax: (44) 0131 650 6535; Email: P.King@ed.ac.uk or Kenneth.King@ed.ac.uk

Co-ordination Address

Michel Carton, Institut Universitaire d'Etudes du Developpement (IUED), Post Box  
136, Rue Rothschild 24, 1211 Geneva 21, Switzerland.  
Telephone: (41) 22 731 5940; Telex: 412584 iued CH;  
Fax: (41) 22 906 5994; Email: carton@fapse.unige.ch

## LIST OF CONTENTS

**PREFACE**

by Kenneth King

**INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION (IDC) AT THE OXFORD CONFERENCE 1-28****Development cooperation and globalisation**

A new agenda for international development cooperation 1-2  
by Jacques Forster

Aid, international cooperation and globalisation: trends 2-5  
in the field of education  
by Michel Carton

The new aid paradigm of the 1990s reviewed 5-8  
by Kenneth King

Fifty not out: reassessing education, development and 8-9  
international cooperation  
by Simon McGrath

**New approaches to Development Cooperation amongst agencies**

The Europeanisation of aid 10-12  
by Wolfgang Gmelin

A new focus for educational assistance: the case of Japan 12-13  
by Yumiko Yokozeki and Nobuhide Sawamura

New sector thinking on support to basic education 13-16  
by Jean-Marie Byll-Cataria

NGOs as partners in Africa: a critical analysis of 16-18  
North-South NGO relations  
by Kingsley Banya and Juliet Elu

**New Challenges for Aid Practice**

Aid coordination: a personal retrospective from 19  
Botswana and Namibia  
by Ulla Kann

Aid coordination at country level - the case of Tanzania 20-21  
by Lene Buchert

**National Responses to changes in IDC**

On managing with development assistance in  
primary education in India 22-24  
by Jandhyala Tilak

International aid and China's education 24-25  
by Kai-ming Cheng

Collaborative research on aid to South African education and training 25-27  
by George Subotzky

The brain drain/gain dimension in international education. 27-28  
by Binod Khadria

**THE UK WHITE PAPER ON ELIMINATING  
WORLD POVERTY 29-41**

New dissemination strategies for the White Paper. 29-30  
by Kenneth King

Targeting poverty, focusing aid 30-32  
by Keith Watson

The White Paper and sustainable livelihoods 33-34  
by Camilla Toulmin

The White Paper and partnership 34-36  
by Roger Riddell

DFID's White Paper and education 36-37  
by Myra Harrison

The DFID White Paper: a critique 37-39  
by Martha Caddell

Education in the East African region - how the  
White Paper influences DFID's future activities 40-41  
by Shona Wynd

**PARTNERSHIP AFRICA TOWARDS A  
NEW SWEDISH POLICY 42-46**

Partnership Africa: a new Swedish approach 42-43

by Lennart Wohlgemuth

Some reflections on partnership, based on the report on  
Sweden's future relations with Africa  
by Ingemar Gustafsson 44

The research challenge in the new partnership  
by M. Bhagavan 45-46

## **HIGHER EDUCATION GETS ANALYSED AT THE WORLD LEVEL 47-52**

The World Conference on Higher Education:  
a first look at the reports of the regional consultations  
by Sobhi Tawil 47-49

Universities in Africa: a report from the front line  
by David Court 49-50

Research cooperation and unequal knowledge systems  
by Berit Olsson 50-51

Some draft policy implications from the higher  
education synthesis study  
by Kenneth King 51-52

## **NORRAG NEWS - THE FIRST DOZEN YEARS (1985-1997) 53-57**

NORRAG NEWS - a view from the joint editors' chair  
by Christine McNab 53-54

Institutionalising NORRAG  
by Wim Biervliet 54-55

NORRAG NEWS from 1986 to 1998  
by Kenneth King 55-57

## **NEWS ABOUT NORRAG AND OTHER NETWORKS 58-60**

CESO is dead! Long live DESC!  
by Rosita van Meel 58-59

The Working Group for International Cooperation in  
Vocational and Technical Skills Development  
by Simon McGrath 59

News about Networks and Members' News 59-60  
by Kenneth King

**ADDITIONAL CONTRIBUTIONS TO NN 21 - 61-67**  
**WORLD CONFERENCE ON ADULT EDUCATION**

Critiquing the methodology of the India study 61-62  
by Anita Dighe

Education for all - does that include nomads? 62-63  
by Caroline Dyer

Expanding International cooperation reflections on the 64-65  
Fifth World Conference in Adult Education  
by Rajesh Tandon

Follow-up activities to CONFINTEA V 65-67  
by Madhu Singh

**MEETINGS 68-73**

Pravina King

**PUBLICATIONS 74-81**

New publication 74  
by Mmantsetsa Marope

New joint publications 75-76  
by Kenneth King

Publications of CAS 76-81  
**CONFERENCE ANNOUNCEMENT**

## PREFACE

NN22, this issue, is in some way the end of an era. SIDA/Sida has supported NORRAG NEWS from the planning of a newsletter in 1985 through to the first issue of NORRAG NEWS in November 1986, and then right through to this issue of December 1997/January 1998. We should offer a big thanks for their support.

Those NORRAG members who are historically minded may wish to look back at that first issue, and see that the production of the first Newsletter was made possible by a Swedish British partnership - between Ingemar Gustafsson, Christine McNab and Anton Johnston on the Swedish side and Kenneth King on the British side. One of the main features of that first issue was a series of articles on developments in the Nordic agencies concerned with development.

It may be coincidental but in this last issue to be supported by Sida, there is again a section that looks at developments in Sweden and at the same time a section examining the latest emphases in international development cooperation in the UK. In the case of both Sweden and the UK there has been a very recent opportunity to examine - or re-examine - partnership. In the case of Sweden, the Ministry for Foreign Affairs drew up proposals, along with Africans, for a new Swedish policy for relations with Africa. After almost a year of consultations, a report, *Partnership with Africa*, was ready to present to government in August 1997. Based on that report, the government will present its new policy to the Swedish parliament early in 1998. In the UK, the new government had produced a new development cooperation policy after just six months of being in office. One of the principal themes of the White Paper *Eliminating World Poverty* (Nov 1997) was, equally, the building of genuine partnerships, principally between North and South, but also within Britain, the intention is to develop new ways of working with the private and voluntary sector and with the research community.

These two policy papers will be briefly examined in this issue of NORRAG NEWS, but there are sufficient resonances between them that an occasion will be found, in Edinburgh, later in the Spring, to tease out some of their commonalities and their insights, and to feed these back to the relevant bodies.

In a way, the NORRAG - Sida relationship itself illustrates some of the characteristics of partnership in the new Swedish recommendations, even if it is between a Northern agency and a network in the North which is concerned with the South. It has, for one thing, been long term. For another, despite the funding inequality, it has striven to be an open and respectful relationship. Thus, throughout the years when Christine McNab and Ingemar Gustafsson were back in Sida, they felt it inappropriate to write articles for NORRAG NEWS or come as members to NORRAG meetings, as it would be difficult to combine funding a particular organisation's activity with being an ordinary member of it. Only now that the decision to cease funding has been taken, do we find them both writing for the newsletter. We shall have to remember to ask them to become ordinary members now!

Members will be pleased to know that ODA - now the Department For International Development - will take over the funding for the next two issues June/July and December 1998. And discussions are underway with another agency for longer term funding thereafter.

This particular issue of NORRAG NEWS builds on the success of that part of the Oxford Conference on Education and Geopolitical Change in 1997 that was concerned with rethinking the North and the South and the associated shifts in international development cooperation.

Many of the short pieces in the first section of this issue will, in longer form, become part of a NORRAG/UNESCO book that, it is hoped, will be ready for the World Conference of Comparative Education Societies in Cape Town in July 1998.

We have a section where the three principal editors of NORRAG NEWS reflect on its changing emphases, in personal terms. This may be a point to mention that there are two collections of NORRAG NEWS which bring into two handy volumes the issues from the time of the Jomtien Conference (No. 7 of 1990) right up almost to the present. These syntheses do not contain the more ephemeral elements such as the announcements of meetings, but otherwise they do carry the essence of the special issues.

Several contributors sent articles related to the World Conference on Adult Education in Hamburg, but these arrived just after we had gone to press. We are delighted to have Anita Dighe and Rajesh Tandon take up the discussion, and to have them joined by Madhu Singh and Caroline Dyer.

A final section of this issue relates to Higher Education. Members will recall that our last venture into higher education was in connection with a series of critical comments on the World Bank's higher education paper. Now there is a new task force on higher education and society that has been formed. We may want to watch with interest how its mandate develops, after it has its first main meeting in Cape Town in February 1998.

In that connection, it is not too early to ask NORRAG Members to make a note in their diaries that we intend to hold our own next Annual General Meeting in Paris, at some suitably antique site of higher education, South of the river, just a day before the opening of the World Conference on Higher Education (for preliminary dates, see Meetings section).

Members will recall that because of the timing of the previous world conference in Hamburg, we delayed our Summer issue of NORRAG NEWS till August. This, NN22, is the Xmas/New Year issue, and we shall go back to having NN23 in June/July, and NN24 in December in 1998.

Kenneth King  
January 1998

**A NEW AGENDA FOR INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION**

Jacques Forster, Graduate Institute of Development Studies (IUED), Geneva

International development co-operation (IDC) is no longer what it used to be! It has been transformed during the past decade in the wake of the changes brought about by the end of the cold war. In that context, two main trends may be mentioned:

- The list of donor and recipient countries has undergone significant changes. Former donors have become recipients of public aid resources. The most obvious example is that of the Republics of the former Soviet Union which have all become recipients of public aid flows. Former net recipients such as the Republic of Korea or Chinese Taipei have become net donors. The significant decline of the aid provided by Arab oil exporting countries has moreover led to a yet greater concentration of aid resources in the hands of the members of the OECD Development Assistance Committee
- At a time when overall aid funding tends to diminish, the scope of IDC is constantly being expanded by the adjunction of new tasks. As development decades went by, new items were added to the IDC agenda which now includes environmental and political dimensions of development. More recently, new items were added to the list of development related tasks such as assistance to democratic development, development related contributions to combat narcotics or non-military dimensions of UN peace-keeping operations.

Moreover, the traditional dichotomy dividing the world into developed and developing areas is questioned on account of three factors:

- the South is increasingly heterogeneous as disparities between groups of countries and within individual countries tend to grow;
- many former communist countries face severe development problems linked notably to the breakdown of institutions or the rise of poverty and of environmental hazards;
- industrialised countries are themselves confronted with considerable challenges related both to the questionable sustainability of their development model (based on economic growth and high levels of per capita consumption of energy) and to the significant rise of poverty and inequality.

It is thus increasingly clear that all regions of the world face unresolved development problems and are, as it were 'developing'.

In this context, a new agenda for IDC is a necessity both in terms of meeting new needs and of acquiring a new legitimacy. IDC should henceforth concentrate its efforts on contributing to the management of some of the world's main global development problems (environment, narcotics, communicable diseases, international transfer of weapons, etc.). This new agenda must also give high priority to traditional development objectives, giving a greater priority than hitherto to low-income countries, and particularly to the group of least-developed countries. Such an agenda should emphasize the long-term common interests of the peoples of the world in the management of problems affecting their welfare and security.

The implementation of such an agenda requires more financial and human resources than development co-operation agencies can presently muster. New resources are necessary. They will not easily be found but a renewed agenda for IDC will be needed to convince large sections of the population that this is the price to pay for global welfare and security and that there are no less costly alternatives.



However, with - or even more without - additional resources, IDC badly needs to increase its efficiency and effectiveness. To achieve this objective, it is not only necessary to improve ODA programmes and projects; it is also mandatory to take a broader look at North-South relations and take into account the impact of other dimensions of these relations on developing countries. This approach has been referred to as the "policy coherence" approach. Policies related to various dimensions of North-South relations should thus be complementary rather than at cross-purposes. Some policies (trade, debt, tied aid and foreign direct investment) have for a long time been included in the development cooperation dialogue. There are new policy areas (environment, drug addiction, AIDS, migrations, human rights, military expenditures and transfers of weapons). This enumeration shows that the quest for greater coherence concerns practically every ministry and government agency.

Since 1992, some DAC members have taken steps to improve the coherence of their policies towards developing countries. They have set up mechanisms to identify possible contradictions or inconsistencies between policies and to attempt to reduce them. Experience shows - as common sense would indicate - that this is not sufficient by far to eliminate all contradiction. Nevertheless such processes can at least identify areas where unintended incoherence prevails and take corrective action. By identifying areas of contradiction, the process also encourages public debate on important issues and ensures that policy decisions are made in full conscience of their impact on developing countries.

O-O-O-O-O

#### AID, INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION AND GLOBALISATION: TRENDS IN THE FIELD OF EDUCATION

Michel Carton, Graduate Institute of Development Studies (IUED), Geneva

As J. Forster rightly points out in his article, international development co-operation (IDC) is no longer what it used to be!

The initial trends identified by K. King in 1991 in the field of aid to education are now clear patterns and the multiple phenomena related to economic and financial globalisation are radically questioning the very concepts behind aid and international co-operation.

Globalisation may be seen primarily as "a process of systematic elimination in time and space of both institutional (legislation) and technological (communication, information) obstacles to the fluidity and the profitability of financial capital". Defined in such a way, globalisation may be seen to have the following impact on the production, as well as on the transmission and appropriation of knowledge:

- \* a strong linkage to innovation as an essential determinant of profitability on increasingly competitive markets.

- \* a strong articulation between education and training. The efficiency of the production and utilisation of knowledge is defined primarily by economic agents (entreprises, firms, corporations).

- \* a simultaneous and increasing dissociation between output flows from education and training systems and input flows in production processes.
- \* a trend towards the standardisation of school-based skills at an international level in view of improved assessment of the potential of labour markets across the globe (TMIS survey).
- \* the promotion of the ideology of entrepreneurship encouraging individuals to assume complete responsibility for their education and training.
- \* the growth of powerful knowledge industries, which has been facilitated by the boom of new information and communication technologies. The development of these industries has been based on the phenomena (cited above) of the standardisation of content and the individualisation of consumption in education and training
- \* the acceleration of the process of political and financial disengagement of the State in the field of education since the early 1980s.
- \* a shift in emphasis from the supply of scientific skills certified by autonomous educational institutions to the demand for technical skills assessed by productive organisations which are intimately linked to financial and economic globalisation.
- \* an increasing social demand for accreditation. Although certification is seen as being an increasingly necessary (yet insufficient) condition to respond to the requirements of increasing productivity and flexibility of work in a highly competitive and uncertain context for individuals. (The fluidity and profitability expected from capital translate into the need for increased mobility and reduced costs).

What we are witnessing then is an acceleration of the multiple phenomena of innovation, deinstitutionalisation, standardisation, privatisation and individualisation of the process and organisational modes of research, education, and training. It is the combined effects of these trends that must be confronted by aid agencies and international development co-operation in the field of education and training. Will such agencies be capable of dealing with these phenomena and proposing original and constructive responses? This uncertainty is particularly patent in the case of public bilateral and multilateral agencies.

The concepts and development strategies adopted by such agencies in the 1970s are now being strongly questioned by the acceleration of phenomena linked to globalisation. The decrease in international development co-operation activity observed since the mid-1980s is now being amplified as a result of:

- \* reduced public resources for development aid and the consecutive and significant drop in the number of positions available within agencies.
- \* the ageing of agency personnel. Staff renewal is far from being guaranteed by a new generation that is more concerned with humanitarian aid, environmental issues and international trade.
- \* the transfer of public development aid to the private sector

(through bidding procedures as used, for example, by the EU) which has resulted in (i) the dislocation of the potential for a coherent overall vision of educational policies, (ii) the shift in emphasis to the rapid resolution of immediate problems (relief having replaced development) and (iii) "capacity debuilding".

\* the significant growth of economic actors for whom educational research and projects constitute new flourishing markets. Corporations (and their "demands" linked to globalisation as mentioned above) are gaining increasing influence in the fields of scientific and technical research, as well as in education and training .

The way in which international development co-operation responds to these phenomena will depend on each agency's analysis of both the general trends of globalisation, as well as its consequences on the ground. If we adopt Annie Vinokur's analysis of globalisation referred to earlier, a number of consequences may be identified for governments in the South. Traditionally constituting the main partners of international co-operation in the South, these governments are now confronted with social and political reactions resulting from the excesses and paradoxes of processes of homogenisation inherent to globalisation (exclusion, poverty).

Reduced public expenditure for human and social development (education, health...) has also given rise to alternative systems of production and dissemination of knowledge not only through new, but also traditional channels (linked to religion, ethnic group, neighborhood, age groups, networks and so forth). Although they were still being resisted one decade ago by governments keen on reinforcing their legitimacy through State educational policies, traditional practices are now largely encouraged. Indeed, the same governments have now "accepted" the rehabilitation of "non rational factors such as religion, culture, tradition (...) as success components of modern economies in a global economy". This acceptance by weakened states is dictated by the need for promoting national competitiveness on a globalised investment market. Both reduced public expenditure in education, as well as the social and financial self-management of education by individuals and groups within civil society, contribute to this competitiveness.

International aid agencies consequently face a dilemma. It is true that the shift of emphasis on NGOs and civil society since the beginning of the 1980s (often in opposition to the State) is now bearing fruit. However, the significance of this shift in emphasis may be quite different. If civil society may indeed still be a source of innovation at the national level, it can also be an instrument of integration into an increasingly competitive global market dictated by transnational economic agents rather than by political and national representatives of this same society.

This partly explains why contradictory positions and practices often develop both within the headquarters of aid agencies, as well as within their decentralised management structures. These may lead to the simultaneous existence, within the same agency, of the following perspectives:

\* a resignation to the trend of reduced public development aid in general, and in the education sector more particularly. The progressive privatisation of international development co-operation has transformed agencies into administrative and financial intermediaries. As a result, trends towards de-professionalisation and the absence of staff renewal are being amplified.

\* a perception of educational innovations within civil society as

instruments of "resistance", not so much against inefficient states, but against increased poverty and exclusion associated with globalisation.

\* the rediscovery of the need for a significant role for the public sector in line with the ideas put forward in the World Development Report (1997). However, partnership, as the new key word, actually often dissimulates asymmetric relationships, not so much with traditional agency experts, but with international consultants.

\* a growing interest among aid agencies in training. As the training sector is seen as representing the link between educational and productive concerns, articulations between sectoral policies in technical and vocational education and training, on one hand, and the promotion of small and micro enterprises, on the other, is now on agency agendas. These new interests reflect concerns for coherence between political, technical, and technological investment policies by countries which are decreasingly seen as "donors".

We are thus far removed from the 20-20 objective proposed by the UNDP in its 1994 Human Development Report: given the 7 percent of bilateral aid and the 16 percent of multilateral aid devoted to human development (including education), can it realistically be hoped that 20 percent of this aid and that 20 percent of national budgets be allocated to development efforts?

The challenge, as suggested by J. Forster, is immense. This is true both for the rising generation of development specialists, as well as for the institutions which must now train them.

O-O-O-O-O

#### THE NEW AID PARADIGM OF THE 1990s REVIEWED

Kenneth King, Centre of African Studies, University of Edinburgh

##### Background: the new aid paradigm: new Norths and Souths

Seven years ago, in 1991, I argued that there was becoming available a new aid paradigm, shared by many agencies. We shall briefly examine what has happened to this development. A test case for the applicability of this paradigm is the article by Subotzky later in this section. The main characteristics of the paradigm were that aid should be 'sustainable, equitable, locally-owned and executed, and supportive of good policies in the education sector as a whole' (King 1992: 257). One of the key elements was that the policy environment itself should be appropriate; without this, there was the danger that aid projects or programmes, however apparently successful, would just become 'enclaves'. The new paradigm was shot through with the metaphor of national capacity building for policy analysis, but it was noted that this donor emphasis on locally owned policy was being promoted at a time when the donors were becoming more certain of their own policy priorities than at any time in the past thirty years. This paradox at the heart of 'policy-based lending' continues to be very evident in much agency activity today. Particularly in respect of Africa, it would appear that the proliferation of ever more international working groups linking governments to external agencies is a reflection of a continuing donor preoccupations with policy coordination.

An increasing concern with accountability in donor countries has gone hand in hand with an interest in seeking to ensure both local ownership and an appropriate set of sectoral policies, as well as policies in the political and economic arena. In other words, donors are anxious to line up three things that don't always go together: a strong local sense of policy ownership; a supportive sectoral environment, and a wider set of appropriate conditions in the political (e.g. human rights record) and/or in the macro-economic arena. Education and training policies of many donors are thus less separable from their wider development cooperation policies than they once were.

At first blush, the current donor preference for avoiding project enclaves and working instead with countries that have developed their own policies sounds very progressive. No more British or Danish flags flying over their own well-known projects.

However, it is not just a question of their being any old national sector framework available if agency support is to be forthcoming. Both a general framework and one or more very specific conditions need to be in place. And it must, ideally, be a policy that is grounded on certain basic parameters;

Policy-based aid of this kind is widespread in agencies other than the World Bank where it has been well known for years. But even those known traditionally for being the most responsive donors within its selected 'programme countries', now openly acknowledge their preference for a coordinated policy, often with a link to other donors, including the World Bank.

So, the paradox about national capacity building for policy analysis would seem to lie in the fact that donors of all kinds have, during the last 7 years of enthusiasm with national capacity building, developed their own very specific sectoral or subsectoral policies, against which they can judge the appropriateness of different country requests. These donor policies on priorities towards particular sub-sectors are now integrated into the agencies' overall development policy, so that, for instance, the general goal of poverty alleviation will need to be observable in the approaches of different sub-sectors. Aid has thus been becoming more coherent, coordinated and rational according to the donor perspective. But it is much less clear how this new aid coherence impacts on the aid recipients.

#### Outcomes of aid coherence

The logic of greater coherence about aid policy in the North has several possible outcomes. At the level of the individual donor country, it is likely to mean much greater clarity about who is to be aided and who is not. Those countries that are amenable to policy dialogue, and which can ensure that their wider macro-economic and political spheres are coherent with current models in the West will become favoured recipients. Others that do not have the capacity to conduct such a dialogue may find themselves increasingly excluded from aid. In fact, one of the outcomes of policy coherence in the North could be the creation of several Souths - those that are aid-worthy and those that have placed themselves beyond the pale of aid.

For those Southern countries which do become acceptable in terms of this more far-reaching policy dialogue, it has been argued that there could emerge a new kind of mutuality - a style of partnership that over-rides the imbalance in resources and consequent inequality between the richer and poorer members of the partnership.<sup>1</sup> This is an intriguing suggestion, but it is one that is probably more possible with bilateral rather than with multilateral agencies. After all, the essence of bilateralism is to build long term relations that have a strong individual and

---

<sup>1</sup>See for example *Partnership with Africa* Ministry for Foreign Affairs, Stockholm

professional dimension to them, and where the two sides are aware of advantages to both sides. This challenge is one that has been faced not only in general bilateral relationships but also in the particular academic link arrangements which are commonplace between Northern and Southern universities (and are funded by bilateral aid).

It will certainly be worth watching these new kinds of mutuality in aid partnerships. The language describing them speaks less of the market than of morality. It is a discourse about trust and it points to the existence of what might be termed a moral economy in aid relations.

A second outcome can be anticipated particularly within the European Union and would involve an extension of some degree of common policy approach across what are currently the highly differentiated traditions of development cooperation within Europe. Over time this development of a European framework for cooperation may reduce the variety of Northern offers of aid. This will not be rapid - at least not in harmonising the distinctions between EU member states that can scarcely be said to have an aid programme at all and those that have had one for decades. The first major attempt at a policy paper - a 'Resolution on Education and Training in Developing Countries'<sup>2</sup> - only took place in 1994.. But what is already clear is that, since the guidelines were adopted, there has been a reduction in the scope for Southern (African, Caribbean and Pacific) countries to set forward their own aid preferences in discussion with the EU:

By 1996, the desire for coherence and coordination in EU aid, including in the Education and Training sector, had moved a stage further to what the Commission is terming Sectoral Development Programmes. This brings the coordinated delivery of EU aid a stage closer. The expected results at the country level are coherent strategic plans which also reflect external priorities:

It is intriguing to note that almost exactly 30 years after the development of a masterplan (*Education for Self-reliance*) that was certainly not the result of an extended policy dialogue with the donors, Tanzania has been selected for this special masterplan development by the EU. In Kenya, too, a Master Plan for the Education and Training Sector, 1997-2010 was virtually complete in mid 1997. Although it has been drafted principally by Kenyans, it would not be an exaggeration to say that it has been very much influenced by particular donor priorities.

We have, thus, a situation in the late 1990s where some countries, open to policy dialogue with the donor community, appear to be agreeing not just on the general thrust of education and training policy, but on a whole series of sub-sectoral targets to be met, and, in the case of Kenya, verified by an agreed logical framework. At the same time as this apparently rather invasive approach is being developed from the North, it would seem that other parts of the North are engaged in exploring new forms of special relationship or partnership with their programme countries in the South.

Thus far we have illustrated these Northern developments almost exclusively from Europe, but it is possible that in other parts of the North, such as Japan, very different approaches are being developed. There has for some time been evidence of Japan's being critical of the aid approaches of the West, and of their desire to produce 'newer, more independent approaches based on Japan's own experience of giving aid'.

#### Redefining the North and the South

---

<sup>2</sup>On coordination between the Community and the Member States on Education and Training Schemes in Developing Countries COM (94) 399 Final, Brussels

How do these developments in aid policy and greater coherence both within individual donor countries and amongst donor groupings leave the whole question of redefining the North and the South, and re-ordering the boundaries of international education?

Preliminary investigation would suggest that although Northern bilateral aid budgets are not rising, - indeed many are falling, and even Japan is accepting cuts - there is little indication that aid policy in the North has become more tentative. Such evidence as there is would point the other way, but there has been some blurring of the sharpness of this certainty by donors about their policy priorities.

This might be represented as a contrast between the search for ever more coherence on the one hand and on the other a new bilateralism which emphasises the moral dimension of aid. The former leads to greater and greater policy conditionality and selectivity. The latter is not at all developed yet, but in essence is an attempt to get away from the financial disparities of the aid relationship to a bilateralism that is based on a recognition of potential contributions from both sides. The third approach - of the Japanese - is also not fully developed yet. But as a country that has appreciated the contribution of aid in its own development, there are strong reasons for it to find a third way between the conditionalities of the World Bank/IMF on the one hand and the bilateralism of Europe on the other.

#### References

King, K. 1992 'The role of the external agencies in local education reform', plenary speaker at Oxford Conference on *The reform of educational systems at the national and local levels*, University College, Oxford, 3-6 September, 1991, reprinted in *IJED* 12 no.4 257-263.

O-O-O-O-O

### FIFTY NOT OUT: REASSESSING EDUCATION, DEVELOPMENT AND INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION

Simon McGrath, Centre of African Studies/ISES, University of Edinburgh

Half a century has elapsed since the emergence of the Bretton Woods system and the beginning of the modern era of development thinking and assistance. This period has seen many advances in educational and developmental theory as well as in the practices of assisting development. Nonetheless, it is clear that there is much that is still ill-understood in these fields. Moreover, as we move into the second half-century of the life of the UN, the World Bank and the IMF it seems increasingly plausible that we are entering a new period of economic, political and social development, around the globe. Thus, even those lessons that have been learned during the experiences of the past 50 years must, in many cases, be reassessed in the light of an emerging new paradigm, captured imperfectly in notions such as globalisation and post-fordism.

In the field of education we are now almost eight years on from the Jomtien mega-conference. Eight years on and yet methodological and practical achievements have been

insufficient to meet the bold targets set back in 1990. Indeed, by 1995 the Development Assistance Committee of the OECD had felt it necessary to move back the date for universal primary education (not education for all) to 2015.

Approaching the end of the millennium, educationalists still struggle to agree on the appropriate subjects to include in a curriculum; the suitable ways of delivering them; and the best approach to testing attainment.

The last fifty years have seen remarkable changes in the fashionability of the economic theories out of which development theory has typically emerged. The post-war era was one in which Keynesianism was dominant in the developed West. Its faith in the important developmental role of the state was such that newly independent or underdeveloped states through the 1950s and 1960s essentially had two exemplars of the central role of the state to draw upon when formulating their own development strategies.

However, by the 1970s the West had abjured Keynesianism (rhetorically if not always practically); and the Socialist alternative was increasingly in decline. Thus the only option increasingly came to be seen as neoliberalism with its desire to weed the economy off its dependence on the state. Structural adjustment programmes proliferated across Africa in particular during the 1980s and the importance of privatisation, fiscal discipline and reduced social expenditure became the mantras of politicians and bureaucrats internationally.

However, the late 1990s indicate that a further sea change may be developing. The evidence of SAPs performance simply fails to stand up to scrutiny, in spite of a wealth of special pleading by the World Bank. Most significantly, the Bank itself has begun to signal that perhaps the state, after all, has been excessively criticised. The past year has also brought home to many the claims of academics that globalisation makes imitation of the tiger economies an uncertain business. As the tigers themselves seem to lose their sleekness in the face of global capital flows and currency speculation, so the idea that they can be a role model for other would-be NICs seems increasingly tendentious.

As time goes on the pre-eminence of the economic in models of development also appears to come under more sustained criticism. Concerns about the environment in particular are highlighting the need to look at development in far more holistic ways than has been orthodox in the last half century.

The world of development assistance has also been transformed over this half century. At the time the multilateral agencies were being set up much of development thinking was focused on a war ravaged Europe. In the 1960s the "wind of change", blowing not just through Africa, led to the establishment of a wide range of complementary bilateral institutions. In this period it was fairly simple to know who was develop and who developing, or, later, North and South. The 1990s have seen such notions become increasingly irrelevant. The collapse of the Soviet system has seen large parts of that ideological block join the ranks of the poor nations, whether temporarily or more permanently. The rise of the tiger economies and the successes of some Latin American economies has brought new donors onto the world scene, in some cases whilst they are still simultaneously recipients.

The 1990s have also witnessed a growing awareness amongst those concerned with development cooperation that relationships have not been cooperative enough, being fundamentally asymmetrical. This has led to a greater focus on local ownership and on the



processes of development assistance. However, agencies are still struggling to reconcile these with the growth in conditionalities that have accompanied the end of Cold War.

Fifty years after the founding of the current system of international relations, on the brink of the new millennium, it is clear that much has been learned and that many sophistications have emerged in our theory and practice of education, development and assistance. Nonetheless, the new challenges emerging, as well as the unfinished business of the past, suggest that there is still a massive task ahead.

O-O-O-O-O

## THE EUROPEANISATION OF AID

Wolfgang Gmelin, (German Foundation for International Development) DSE, Bonn

With the end of the Cold War and the bipolar hegemony particularly smaller and less influential countries have lost their political leverage for securing development aid. On the other hand the chances for a true development oriented cooperation based upon common values shared by a majority of donors stand better. In principle this would favour multilateral and internationally more coherent coordinated development cooperation.

Because of the still relative unimportance of development policy in comparison to foreign or security policy such a multilateralisation should be feasible in particular in the European Union context where a European Community competence in the far more important area of trade policy is by and large accepted. In addition the European Union has managed to establish itself as a successful model for an integrated monitoring transcending bilateral cooperation in many spheres. Through the Lomé Convention it disposes of an innovative mechanism for development cooperation based on multi-dimensional policy dialogue. However, in spite of the magnitude of European development assistance its international political weight is comparatively small. Taken together the development assistance of the European Union and the member states account for more than 50 percent of the global development assistance. There is a blatant lack of competent coordination because there is so far no common frame of reference in the form of a EU global strategy. However, there are a number of jointly elaborated guidelines and sector concepts which so far are not paid heed to very extensively by the member states. The Green Book issued by the Commission in November 96 in order to lay the foundations for a new development cooperation clearly stresses the political dimension of cooperation criticising previous cooperation with politically doubtful partners and not insisting sufficiently on performance and transformation. However, the commission paper is still somewhat half-hearted when it comes to support for reforms as it still puts a high premium on "structural stability" as an end in itself, overlooking that democratisation is accompanied by profound social changes and possibly instability. There is no universally valid development model and reforms may originate in different sectors and may be borne by other actors than the government. Therefore specific and differentiated criteria beyond good governance as an all-encompassing conditionality are needed. Instead of the very formal consultation processes established under the Lomé Convention room should be given to broad based and well informed policy dialogue with interested stakeholders from different camps. The Green Book, however, is stipulating the involvement of institutions and organisations outside the

central government and subscribes to the idea of local capacity by not yet further concretised "networks for analytical and technical assistance" which hopefully will not result in the promotion of new capacities for planning but rather in associations or partnerships between local and foreign experts.

In spite of many convincing arguments for a multilateralisation of development cooperation within the EU framework there is a strong movement for the bilateral in almost all of the donor countries claiming that **Bilateral cooperation** is rooted much more strongly in the respective society and policy, that it is more transparent and therefore better controllable, that it is more flexible in combining various governmental and nongovernmental instruments and that it is highly recognised in the partner countries for its professionalism. At home bilateral cooperation is borne by broad segments of a pluralistic society with a high degree of identification of the public and of professionals in ministries, NGOs and in research institutions reflecting the respective professional competence for and familiarity with the issues and countries to be dealt with. European development cooperation has to live up to this record even though nobody will deny the comparative strengths of it when it comes to larger scale and politically sensitive programmes. However, it is so far not rooted to the same extent in the civil and professional communities as the bilateral. But European development cooperation has many chances of being a different form of multilateralism given the existing political framework and cooperation machinery. There is a common core of development thinking and of criteria on which there is sufficient agreement among the member states to establish a common frame of reference. There is a convincing case for for a EU competence in conceptual and policy matters which would enhance Europe's role in global, regional, national or sectoral policy dialogues. This is an asset that could be played vis-a-vis national interests in the member states be they political or economic. So far the trade-offs of more Europeanisation in the field of development cooperation have not been systematically put forward and put into a bargain. There are still strong and well entrenched special relationships with the Lomé countries, but based on a common policy there could be gradually more of joint action building on the respective professional competencies of the member states' cooperation institutions. The coordination of this division of labour on the basis of a common policy would be the task of the European Union drawing on solid information about the specific needs in the countries and the various bilateral cooperation activities and the competencies through dialogue among partner countries and member states. The capacity of the EU Commission for conceptualising, planning and monitoring development cooperation has improved during the last years. The Green Book and various sector coordination exercises, e.g. for education and training, are witness of this. However, given the importance and magnitude of the European development cooperation and in comparison to another big donor as, e.g. the World Bank, or to bilateral cooperation, this capacity may still be considered inadequate.

As stated above European development cooperation is multilateral with a special quality and a good deal of the potential of the bilateral. Europeanisation thus could take on the quality of combining the better parts of the bi- and the multilateral. One important prerequisite is the rooting of the European development cooperation in the public opinion of the member states and in the professional competence of the development constituencies both in research and practice and in governmental and nongovernmental organisations. This means going far beyond the formalised exchanges of information and decision making which exist so far at the level of the Council of Ministers and the various committees for project review and approval. The proposals in the Green Book for enhanced information, control and coordination with the implicit reform of the EDF-committee and the strengthening of the Commission are one necessary step. The strengthening of the Commission is unavoidable

because unlike its counterparts in the bilateral they cannot rely on a professional infrastructure for analysis, research and implementation but are dependent on consultants. But the rooting of European development cooperation will have to go much further into creating public acceptance and legitimacy. One dimension for the time being means strengthening the role of the European Parliament which is, however, at present not yet democratically representative of a European electorate. Tying in the professional communities of "developers" from the member states could be in the form of a European Council for Development Cooperation in which the governmental and quasi-governmental agencies, non-governmental and private organisations and research institutes of the member states and eventually the Lomé countries would be represented. Such a body could be a professional dialogue partner for the Commission, the Council of Ministers, the European Parliament. Such a body composed of development professionals could gradually enhance the understanding of the respective competencies and procedures. It would be a more formal way of getting the national development constituencies of the member states involved in European development cooperation than the ad hoc cooperation of consultings from different member countries having secured contracts from the Commission. There is a need for intermediate European bodies bringing together the interested professionals from the member countries.

0-0-0-0-0

#### A NEW FOCUS FOR EDUCATIONAL ASSISTANCE - THE CASE OF JAPAN

Yumiko Yokozeki, Japan International Cooperation Agency  
Nobuhide Sawamura, Hiroshima University

Japan has been expanding its international aid rapidly and has become one of the world's major donor countries. It has also intended to increase its assistance for expansion of quality education in developing countries, in line with the declaration adopted at the World Conference on Education for All in 1990.

So far, the country seems to have been mainly trying to conform to an international standard in terms of volume and policy. Japan certainly has the increasing desire to play a leading role in the aid community. Even in the context of African development, where Japan has generally much less experience, Japan has shown a readiness to take the initiative and not merely attempt to supplement other donors' activities.

Japan has been increasing its assistance to Africa. Japanese aid to Africa now accounts for some 10 percent of the total international aid provided. It is an important task for Japan to work out development strategies for Africa, learning from its own history and successful experiences in Asia.

In Africa we also have an encouraging phenomenon. The Tokyo International Conference on African Development (TICAD) was held in 1993, inviting all the prominent heads of state from Africa. The conference was epochal in that it called upon not only traditional donors

but also Asian countries to cooperate for African development. Japan will host the second meeting in 1998.

A very strong political commitment is made for cooperation with African countries. For example, Japanese Foreign Minister announced a set of new initiatives on aid to Africa at the session of the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development in April 1996 held in South Africa, which stressed the importance of human resource development. The initiatives include that \$100 million will be spent on education, focusing on primary education, in Africa and that 3,000 participants will be invited for technical training to Japan over the three years beginning in 1996. Furthermore, Japan will make available its contribution to the Japan UNDP Human Resources Development Fund in order to promote South-South cooperation particularly between Asia and Africa.

In May 1996, an OECD/DAC report (*Shaping the 21st Century: The Contribution of Development Co-operation*) was launched, which concerns a long-term strategy for development cooperation. It is said that Japan took the initiative to set forth the development goals in the report, which would be unusual for Japan in formulating international policy.

These encouraging trends at the policy level may not translate at the implementation level.

O-O-O-O-O

#### NEW SECTOR THINKING ON SUPPORT TO BASIC EDUCATION

Jean-Marie Ahlin Byll-Cataria, Swiss Agency for Development & Co-operation, Bern

The Swiss Agency for Development and Co-operation has been very active in the field of development for more than three decades now. It is therefore not a new donor. However, its philosophy has evolved through the years. The SDC has developed new co-operation relations taking into account the social, political and economic situation of its partner countries and also the lessons learned from its own experience.

Indeed, for more than 25 years, the whole international development effort has essentially been based on technical assistance and most development projects have been influenced by foreign expertise and channelled through State bodies.

Since the 1980s, the SDC has moved from technical assistance to an approach based on an entire process of support to local efforts, dynamics and initiatives, in a spirit of partnership. In this relationship emphasis is placed primarily on the vision of development of the various partners of the SDC in developing countries.

In the field of education these new co-operation relations are outlined in the sector policy for basic education approved by the Directorate in January 1996.

This sector policy is "primarily an orientation and management tool. As such, it is intended to serve our partners. Its value therefore depends entirely on the use that is made of it. If it is to be effective, it must be geared to the specific local situation (....), and it needs to be reviewed at intervals to take into account developments on the ground and in our aid programme. Only under these conditions can it be an effective guide" (SDC, Sector Policy - Basic Education, p. 3)

The document is based on an analysis of the situation and problems of basic education in developing countries, the policies of these countries, the development in international co-operation and also on the conclusions drawn from SDC's experience in this area.

The main difficulties faced by developing countries in the field of basic education have been identified as follows:

- stagnation, or even a drop in school attendance figures;
- a decline in the quality of the education provided;
- the gap between school and society at large;
- the failure of schools to prepare their pupils for responsible adulthood;
- the ineffectiveness of literacy campaigns;
- inequitable distribution of educational resource. (Sector Policy, p 6)

It may also be noted that "at the present time, the educational policies and projects of LDCs are often strongly influenced by the funding agencies. This situation has arisen from the dependence of such countries on foreign aid and the weakness of their national institutions. There is a danger that the pressure exerted by sponsor and the influence of foreign experts may, in certain cases, induce the State to abandon part or all of its responsibilities for deciding policy and planning its basic education provision" (Op. Cit., p. 10).

Concerning basic education and Swiss Development Cooperation, "the priority objective (...) is to support developing countries and enable them to further their development by their own efforts. Human resources, and in particular basic education, are key areas in this respect. They are one of the pillars on which the lasting economic and social development of countries, regions and underprivileged groups within society needs to be build".

In their analysis of the trends likely to feature prominently in the years ahead, "North-South Guidelines" ("Lignes directrices Nord-Sud") and the "Mission Statement of the SDC" ("Image directrice de la DDC") point out the need to rethink the way we support education and training. The development of human resources was chosen as one of the SDC's five priorities for the 1990s.

"Aid in this sector must be geared to supporting forms of vocational education and training - in both the state and non-state sectors - which encourage participation in productive activities and in local and national associations, and improve the living conditions of the group concerned". (p 13)

The new sector policy does not differ very much from this.

"The purpose of the basic education programmes supported by the SDC is to promote a form of knowledge which is geared to the cultural and economic conditions of the societies concerned, and which makes for the vocational integration of children and adults into their society."

The SDC seeks first and foremost to act as an advocate in favour of groups and societies marginalised by existing education systems; rural and suburban communities, peasants, entrepreneurs and artisans in the non-state sector, girls and women. Such groups are not marginal minorities excluded from the development process, but large social classes, sometimes forming the majority, which have often been ill served by an education system insufficiently responsive to their needs.

The SDC supports the initiatives and achievements of local activists in the field of basic education, with the aim of encouraging the participation of local communities and the transfer of responsibility for education structures to the local or regional level, wherever possible.

"The SDC will also seek to support certain groups which are marginalised on account of their ethnic or cultural origins, by helping them to develop a form of basic education in their mother tongue, when they themselves take the initiative to do so". (Op. Cit. p 18)

"Whilst convinced of the need for an integrated vision of the educational system and training as a whole, the SDC contributes to the creation of programmes in the sector of primary education in partner countries concerned to introduce substantial reforms in their educational systems. These are countries where primary provision is entirely in the hands of the state, but where there is a need to improve the quality of the teaching. The SDC concentrates its support on a few specific sub-sectoral areas, the aim being to promote innovation in education and the decentralisation of certain decision-making and management functions". (Op. Cit. p 19)

The implementation of this policy requires the following priority accompanying measures:

- Supporting initiatives intended to adapt the content of education and training to local conditions (use of mother tongue, references to local culture, etc).
- Supporting initiatives intended to increase and improve the access of women and girls to education and training programmes.
- Supporting research intended to form a bridge between formal and non-formal education systems, particularly in countries where school attendance figures are very low.
- Encouraging dialogue on education policy in the countries concerned.
- Taking part in international coordination.
- Encouraging exchanges and regional co-operation in the countries of the South.

- Encouraging the exchange of experience between different countries, regions and continents, so that new ideas in areas as varied as pedagogical approach, the production of teaching materials on a limited budget or decentralised management can be shared and capitalised on.
- Assessing the effectiveness of projects and whether they can be reproduced in other situations.

Quite apart from this co-operation approach that the SDC tries to implement in the field, there are many challenges that its partner countries have to face and for which there is presently no adequate response, namely:

- As each development agency has its own sector policy for education and each country has many bilateral and multilateral co-operation partners, how can it deal with so many policies whose objectives and approaches are so often different from one another?
- In the majority of LDCs, the formal educational system is still a legacy of the former colonial power and is not adapted to the social, cultural and economic environment of the pupils. More and more students who graduate are unemployed. How can education, training and employment be aligned?
- What of gender issues in education?

More and more girls have access to schools and literacy centres. Does it necessarily mean that their concerns are taken into account in terms of the curricula, the teaching methodologies, teachers' training, working conditions, etc?

- The international development community insists today on policy dialogue and capacity building. In the developing countries, especially in Africa, the democratic process favoured the emergence of an associative movement. Different associations of the civil society want to take part in the policy dialogue, now that parents must pay for their children's education.

How do governments and foreign aid agencies take into consideration their concerns and visions of education?

In this respect does capacity building in the countries only mean training the local experts in using new management tools? Should it not focus also on attitudes, behaviours and approaches that enable them to accompany at regional and local levels communities, association of parents, women, artisans in their development process, so that they may express their own visions and concerns in the framework of a nation-wide policy dialogue?

- Finally, how do we develop complementarity between formal and non-formal education in order to achieve basic education for all?

0-0-0-0-0

## NGOS AS PARTNERS IN AFRICA: A CULTURAL ANALYSIS OF NORTH-SOUTH NGO RELATIONS

Kingsley Banya, Florida International University & Juliet Elu, Spelman College, Atlanta, GA

Some 30 odd years after formal independence, African countries have still not achieved the economic, social, and political self-sufficiency that the pioneers of decolonisation had anticipated. In many parts of the continent, the initial gains made after colonial rule have disappeared resulting in economic and social stagnation, and in extreme cases, disintegration, (e.g. the chaos in Liberia, Congo, and Sierra Leone). The persistent poverty of many countries in Africa is debilitating and dehumanising.

This situation is no better in the 1990s, as indicated by the Bank's Human Development Report of 1996. According to the report, all the countries of Sub-Saharan Africa are listed in the "Low Human Development Category". In many of these countries (e.g. Mali, Sierra Leone, and Burkina Faso), the annual per capita incomes have declined dramatically. It has also become apparent that governments alone cannot achieve meaningful development; the involvement of both citizens and foreign assistance are necessary. The nature of this involvement has included the external non-governmental organisations (NGOs) and indigenous volunteer development organisations (VDOs).

With increased diversity and complexity of activities, substantial levels of financing, and growing levels of external support and internal legitimacy, the proliferation of external non-governmental organisations (NGOs) and Southern volunteer development organisations (VDOs) have become one of the key new factors on the African development scene. A growing number of aid donors and national governments (e.g. United Kingdom, Norway, etc.) have turned to NGOs as potential instruments for implementing official development projects, especially those intended to channel public resources to the poor. Some reasons for this include the growing interest of aid donors and national governments in strengthening the developmental roles of institutions outside the public sector, and the demonstrated capacity of some non-governmental organisations (NGOs) to reach the poor more effectively than public agencies. In addition, a sharp decline in public development resources has necessitated a search by governments for more cost effective alternatives to conventional public services and development programs. The growth of the power, external support, and legitimacy for NGO involvement makes them worthy of being understood in their complexity and diversity. Major development financial institutions, such as the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund (IMF), the African Development Bank, and host governments, are increasingly focusing on the issue of Northern NGO's and Southern NGO's involvement in development. It has been increasingly felt that a partnership between North and South NGOs would enhance the significance of transparency, equality, and mutual accountability. Donor agencies such as the United States Agency for International Development (USAID), the European Development Program (EDP), the World Bank, and the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) attached some importance to national NGO/donor relationship. Donor organisations felt that highlighting institutional development, as a specific objective of the collaboration can also enhance local control over the direction of sustainable development and help build capacity and confidence. Such an effort can increase sustainability by developing and local independent structures and strengthening "civil society institutes." In a North-South partnership, goals and objectives, it was felt, would be co-determined to the satisfaction of all participants. It was felt that the time was ripe for a catalytic program to enhance collaborative efforts among partners.



This would help in disseminating information about each other's work. Above all such a relationship could provide seed moneys for Southern NGO initiatives.

#### Case Studies of North/South NGO Collaborations

Using highlights of case studies from education and agriculture in Sierra Leone relations between the South and the North are briefly examined.

#### The Bunumbu Teacher Education Project

By the early 1970s, Sierra Leone was exhibiting some of the most dysfunctional manifestations of an inherited colonial educational system. By the end of the 1970s, UNESCO acting as executive agency and the UNDP were committed to what has become commonly referred to as the 'Bunumbu Project'. An assessment of the project after its implementation indicates that three major areas were responsible for the lack of success viz.: a) the way needs assessment was carried out without genuine commitment of the people affected; b) personnel problems in both training of indigenous staff and the hiring of expatriates who could cope with the remoteness of Bunumbu and c) the inadequate equipment especially the sophisticated video system that was extremely difficult to maintain because of lack of electricity and skilled human resources.

#### Agriculture: Eastern Area Integrated Agricultural Development Project (EIADP)

Problems with NGO's are not limited to education, as in Bunumbu, but occur in almost every endeavour. The Integrated Agricultural Development Project (IADP) was an endeavour to provide credit to small farmers to facilitate the adoption of recommended agricultural innovations (EIADP Annual Report, 1976). The major objective of the project was to provide necessary farm inputs to small inland valley swamp rice, cocoa, and oil palm farmers in order that they adopt modern methods of farming and "...to raise the incomes and living standards of about 2,500 near subsistence smallholders in Eastern and Southern provinces of Sierra Leone" (IBRD, 1972).

In the planning phase, time spent in the field was limited, thus only rudimentary data were available for planning purposes. Official agencies did virtually all the identification, planning, and appraisals. As farmers and local bodies had so little input, upland rice and coffee, the two most important crop activities in the project were not considered until nearly a decade after the project's inception. Productivity gains for inland valley swamp rice was only 89% of forecast. Swamps were poorly developed; low viability seeds were shipped; the untimely and inadequate use of fertilisers caused problems. Seed was shipped at times when planting could not be carried forth which resulted in recipients eating the rice rather than planting it. Women, the backbone of agriculture in Sierra Leone were not consulted and their roles were ignored. Loans were available to men on the basis of their worth and social standing, the "rural elites". Northern NGOs encountered unusually long procurement times. Rains during the season made roads impassable into, and within, the agricultural areas. Project managers lasted less than 10 months in their positions. The actual cost of the project was 20% higher than estimated, largely due to staffing patterns which placed expatriates in planning and implementing positions rather than local personnel. Perhaps initial, open discussions between the NGOs involved regarding project goals and targets could have mitigated the loan recovery and increase productivity, hence self-reliance in food production.

Conclusion

In an effort to alleviate poverty and human deprivation, establish civil society, and increase the GDP of developing communities, NGOs have become an integral part of the development effort. However, Northern NGOs' role has been increasingly questioned and challenged by both the governments and voluntary organisations of the South. Both the EIADP and Bunumbu projects clearly show it would take a considerable amount of time before equity can exist between the two types of NGO organisations.

O-O-O-O-O

**AID COORDINATION. A PERSONAL RETROSPECTIVE FROM BOTSWANA AND NAMIBIA**

Ulla Kann, Ministry of Education, Namibia

There are different interpretations of what is meant by aid coordination. From the recipient country's perspective aid coordination is the coordination by the recipient of the support provided by various donor agencies in order to see to it, *inter alia*, that overlaps between donor agencies are avoided, that donor support follows the national policies and priorities, that the aid is not too costly in the long run and so on. However, from the donor's perspective aid coordination appears to be the responsibility of the donor agencies. Left to the recipient government is aid management, or rather aid administration and reporting.

In reality there are three different kinds of aid coordination, all necessary for the successful implementation of aid i.e. coordination within the recipient government system, coordination between government and donors, and coordination among donors. Some countries have a separate institution/ministry for the coordination of aid (Namibia). In other countries aid coordination is part of the finance ministry (Botswana). UNDP and the World Bank have virtual monopoly on arranging meetings between a country and different donor agencies to that country. Recently the interest in donor policies has increased and some donor agencies have begun to understand that their varying and ever changing policies and procedures are difficult to handle for the recipient. One example is the almost mandatory inclusion of a so called Logical Framework in project documents. The problem here is that each agency has their own version of a Logical Framework. Donor agencies have many advantages in the field of aid coordination. They speak the same language. They know the jargon and the acronyms. They have the latest information. They have access to the top level, to ministers, permanent secretaries and sometimes even to the president. In addition, they organise their internal meetings both at country sector level and internationally. They are much better informed about the aid situation and about general recipient country affairs, than the civil servants in the recipient country. There are not many papers on aid coordination written by nationals of a recipient country. However, almost all papers on aid coordination talk about the importance of recipient country ownership of projects and programmes. In theory there appears to be agreement, but why does the practice not work?

Finally, some lessons learnt:

- "We should keep in mind that the costs of mistakes to donors....are normally small, if not negligible, whereas the costs to governments could prove to be catastrophic no matter how small the share of aid in the education budget." (Hallak, J., 1995) Negotiation with aid agencies: a dwarf against a giant. IIEP contributions No. 19. UNESCO: IIEP, Paris. p. 7).
- The importance of establishing a good reputation, trust, with the agencies.
- Don't forget the word NO.
- Advantages and disadvantages of projects versus direct budget support versus sector support.
- The link between aid projects and national development plans.
- The importance of networking and information sharing both internally and with agencies
- The "fly-in-fly-out" consultants have little time, and/or maybe little interest, in developing local capacity in research and in general analysis. There is a need for ethics, morals, standards to be adhered to by agencies and external consultants by including local capacity building also in short-term consultancies. More inventive approaches are needed in how best to use expatriate and technical assistance personnel.

#### AID CO-ORDINATION AT COUNTRY LEVEL: THE CASE OF TANZANIA

Lene Buchert, UNESCO<sup>3</sup>, Paris

Co-ordination of external aid by national governments within a framework of government-designed national policies and programmes has been identified as one potentially effective means to improving development in developing countries (see, for example, Inter-Agency Commission, 1990). In reality, co-ordination rarely reflects this ideal. It may instead refer to a spectrum of activities solely among agencies or between agencies and government, more often directed by the agencies than led by the government. Activities may include: consultation and exchange of information; common understanding of policy and programme objectives and priorities; policy and sector analysis at the country level; co-operation in project and programme design and execution; and co-operation in policy formulation (see, for example Sack, 1995).

In the case of Tanzania, co-ordination of external aid by the national government was stated as an overriding issue after the elections in October 1995. With respect to education, a beginning was made with the setting up in August 1996 of an Education Sector Co-ordinating Committee within the Ministry of Education and Culture (MOEC), with support from the European Union. It is questionable, however, whether its work is led by MOEC or whether it can become a satisfactory mechanism for co-ordination of education sector work. Otherwise, co-ordination has been relatively weak in Tanzania both in terms of inter-agency interaction and in terms of agency-government interaction. Only since February 1992, have agencies held regular (bi-monthly) meetings to discuss matters of mutual interest. The issue of government-agency co-operation and co-ordination became, however, the subject of intense discussion among the agencies during 1996. In late 1996, two agencies began to discuss co-ordination of their work in primary education in close interaction with MOEC. Before then, little co-ordination had taken place of the numerous education projects implemented in Tanzania both as regards co-financing and as regards formulation and implementation of the full project cycle by several agencies.

During the 1990s, there has, however, been co-ordination or co-operation at the policy formulation level. Of the many agencies working in Tanzania, Danida, Sida and the World Bank have been particularly influential in interacting with the government concerning new policy

---

<sup>3</sup> The paper has been written in a personal capacity and does not necessarily express the views of UNESCO.

development for the education and social sectors. An analysis of some of this recent policy formulation shows that only some of the resulting policy papers are owned by the government and that, in most cases, their formulation has been an exclusive process. In several cases, the policy papers are the result of agency pressure on the government to provide the frameworks within which their own programmes and projects could be implemented (Buchert, 1997, forthcoming).

The Tanzania case shows government difficulty in breaking the cycle of high-level dependence on international aid in a context of financial austerity. Macro-economic policies continue to be determined by external financial agencies and government budgets remain insufficient to cover identified, even minimal needs. While agencies express their positive commitment to government-led co-ordination, they do not all agree on the approaches that have to be taken to solve immediate problems or to initiate long term development based on common understandings among themselves and with the Tanzanian government. Neither do they operate according to a common set of procedures that would allow them to work together as defined by governments in specific national contexts.

Co-ordination in the ideal sense of the word does not, therefore, seem to be immediately apparent in Tanzania. Here, as elsewhere, it will take, among others, courage on behalf of the government to withstand agency pressure and willingness on behalf of the agencies and their national governments to give up the self-interest which is often guiding international aid. Meanwhile, the government in Tanzania would have to continue to consider the pros and cons of working with the agencies individually or working with the agencies as one or more groups.

## References

- Buchert, Lene. Forthcoming. Co-ordination of aid to education at the country level: some experiences and lessons from Tanzania in the 1990s. In Buchert, Lene and Kenneth King (eds.) *International Development Co-operation in Education at a Cross-roads*. Unesco Publishing in cooperation with NORRAG.
- Buchert, Lene. 1997. *Education policy formulation in Tanzania: co-ordination between the Government and international aid agencies*. A Report from the IWGE. Paris, UNESCO: International Institute for Educational Planning
- Inter-Agency Commission. 1990. *World Declaration on Education for All and Framework for Action to Meet Basic Learning Needs*. Jomtien, Thailand, 5-9 March 1990. New York, Unicef House.
- Sack, Richard. 1995. *Donor Coordination at the Country Level: Experiences from an "Upstream Education Policy Analysis Project and Conceptual Explorations"*. UNESCO, Policies and Sector Analysis Division, Bureau for Relations with Extrabudgetary Funding Sources (BER). Working Documents.

## ON MANAGING WITH DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE IN PRIMARY EDUCATION IN INDIA

Jandhyala B G Tilak\*, National Institute of Educational Planning & Administration, New Delhi

The 1990s is a decade that marks a new phase of developments in education in general, and primary education in particular, in India. Preceded by a serious economic crisis, the Government of India adopted in 1990 structural adjustment policies, which had inflicted serious cuts in budgetary resources for education, including elementary education in particular. Consequently, a social safety net programme was launched to protect vulnerable but important sectors like primary education and health from the adverse effects of stabilisation and structural adjustment policies. Thus began the international assistance for primary education in India, which has been the most significant development, as external assistance was not sought even for other levels of education for a long time by the government of India during the fifty years of independence. Rather for the first time, primary education sector was opened to external assistance. Starting with World Bank assistance for primary education in ten districts in Uttar Pradesh and that of UNICEF in Bihar, a plethora of international -- both multi-lateral and bi-lateral -- aid organisations are in operation in India working on primary education system. In order to ensure better coordination from the point of view of the government of India and governments of various states (provinces) in India on the one hand, and various international aid organisations on the other, the government of India has launched a programme of District Primary Education Programme (DPEP), as a broad overall umbrella of international aid programmes in primary education in the country. Quite a few other programmes assisted by external agencies that were in existence before the formation of the DPEP are also brought under this common umbrella. A few random and somewhat tentative, but important dimensions of the Programme may be briefly noted in this short article.

Given the situation in some other countries where a multitude of external agencies work on primary education uncoordinated, and even contributing to confusion with conflicting policies and approaches, the formation of this overall umbrella of DPEP by the government of India could be seen as an important step in a positive direction that facilitated better coordination, avoided duplication and ensured some kind of coherence and consistency in the overall programme.

But this also produced a different kind of problem. One of the primary strategies of the DPEP is decentralisation of policy making, planning, administration and implementation of the educational policies and plans which is very important in a big country like India, where some of the states and even districts are larger than many countries in the world in terms of population. But when a uniform format was prepared under DPEP essentially by the Government of India, some of the fundamental aspects relating to decentralisation went into oblivion. While the plans are formulated at decentralised levels, the formats for the same were given by the central government. The formats included detailed procedures and guidelines to be followed at every step. They also included specific limits on the availability of external resources and their broad pattern of allocation between different major items of expenditure -- which are the same for all districts. It can be felt that at best the responsibility of implementation of the programme is decentralised, that too with limited degrees of freedom. This could not be avoided not only because the central government and several state governments are involved, but also because, to a great extent, the funding agencies find it convenient to follow a commonly agreed format. Perhaps it can also be stated that such a common format enabled state governments and new funding agencies to enter the scene and progress fast as well. Both find it convenient, though at the same time they might realise the loss of scope for innovations and experimentation in their activities.

At the same time, it should be stated that manpower, including planners, administrators, educationists and community leaders at decentralised levels -- the states, the districts and even lower levels -- are involved in the preparation of the plans and in their execution, which gives not necessarily a pseudo, but in fact somewhat a rich, flavour of decentralisation.

Starting with 42 districts in seven states in phase I of the DPEP in 1994, the programme has expanded to cover 149 districts, and in fact, is being planned soon to cover 194 districts in fifteen states, out of the total 500 and odd districts in the country. The government and also the external agencies could run such a massive programme relatively easily without facing serious problems and constraints, unlike in many other countries, partly because of the existence of highly trained, skilled and talented manpower, though not sufficiently evenly spread all over the country. As a result, the need on a large scale for consultants from abroad is not felt either by the government or by the external agencies. Further, capacity building of the manpower at local levels has been an important component of the programme, which gradually fulfils the increasing demand for trained middle level manpower.

Similarly the massive programme could be run relatively smoothly, as a large amount of research on various aspects of primary education, which can be called in the terminology of the international funding organisations 'sector work' is already available, and the gaps in research could be filled in no time, due to the existence of a large network of universities and research institutions in the country with sufficiently well trained researchers. In a sense, the external agencies might not have felt the need for extensive TA (technical assistance work) to start the project. Further, the programme has a component of strengthening of research and research capacities.

A few more important trends are emerging, which may have serious long term implications. In a sense, the whole approach of the DPEP is highly sectarian, instead of being holistic to the cause of education development. Other levels of education are being increasingly ignored. Not only budgetary resources for secondary and higher education are either stagnant or have declined in recent years, but also even the planning and management aspects of secondary and higher education do not seem to be receiving the usual level of, if not adequate, attention of the government. Even upper primary level, which is a part of the compulsory elementary ('basic') education in India, seems to have been receiving not any sufficient attention. Further, while the DPEP cells have been endowed with a higher level of physical, human and financial resources, and are also associated with modernisation and efficiency, systemic improvement such as in case of directorates of school education including primary education) in the states is not noticeable. Such a sectarian approach causes serious imbalances in education development in the society.

With the creation of autonomous 'societies' at national, state, district and village levels to take control of management and implementation of the programme, the government machinery seems to have been slowly sidelined. These parallel structures erode the importance of the government. In short, all this may lead to an increasingly reduced role of the government in education as a whole, including in primary education. Already an unfortunate and not necessarily a correct impression is being created that improvement in primary education in the country will be possible only with the help of external assistance. As a result, district after district and state after state are eager to enter the DPEP.

Lastly, during the last 3-4 years of operation of the Programme, slowly and steadily a balance could be reached between the two actors, who initially started as enthusiastic donors and reluctant recipients. One only wishes that the situation improves only to such a level that the

reverse does not happen, i.e., the recipients become too enthusiastic and the donors reluctant. It is the responsibility of both the external agencies and the government to see that such a situation is avoided. The government might rely on external funds only to the extent it is absolutely necessary, and the external agencies finance in such a way that dependency of the national government on external resources does not increase and that the system indeed becomes self reliant. This may emerge as a serious challenge to both sides.

Notes:

\* The views expressed here are the author's personal views and are not necessarily shared by the organisation he is associated with.

1 For a review of Asian experience with structural adjustment policies and their effects on education, see Tilak "Effects of Adjustment on Education: A Review of Asian Experience," Prospects 27 (1) (March 1997): 85-107.

2 I have briefly discussed some of the features including major strengths and weaknesses of the programme in Norrag News 19. See "India: District Primary Education Programme (DPEP)," NORRAG News 19 (June 1996): 41-43.

O-O-O-O-O

## INTERNATIONAL AID AND CHINA'S EDUCATION

by Kai-ming Cheng, University of Hong Kong

The introduction of foreign aid was an immediate consequence of China's open door policy which started 20 years ago. This was against the belief during the Cultural Revolution, and the years before, that reception of any foreign aid would infringe the principle of self-reliance.

The acceptance of foreign aid came in parallel with an acceptance of foreign capital. It was a breakthrough in ideology, to believe that the nation can develop not only by passively protecting itself against any foreign interaction, but also by actively utilising foreign resources as a mutually beneficial investment.

The overall attitudes towards foreign aid, however, have still been cautious. This is partly to do with the residual ideology of dealing with foreign powers which are but part of the world hegemony, but it is also partly to do with 'face' - meaning that national dignity has to be upheld under any circumstances.

The caution is also supported by the relatively small scale of foreign aid when compared with the national budget. Foreign aid is often seen as seed money as a bait to 'fish' from other sources of resources. It is also used for pivotal purposes to achieve goals which are not achievable in a structured funding system.

Under these circumstances, the kind of 'dependency' which easily occurs elsewhere in countries of comparable economic strength does not seem to exist in China. Quite on the contrary, China could sometimes afford some degree of arrogance towards the aid agencies, particularly at times when such agencies compete to provide aid to China.

It should not be mistaken that China is unified in its attitudes towards foreign aid. In the realm of education, for example, there has always been a division of views about where foreign aid should go. There are arguments that foreign aid should be invested in under-developed areas, so that education could lay the foundation for sustainable development. There are also the other arguments, however, that foreign aid could be more efficiently utilised in more developed areas which are equipped with the better capacity to make full use of the funds.

The real challenge to China vis-à-vis foreign aid is its growing economic strength, which is eroding its membership in the developing world. Almost a decade ago, major international agencies had already moved to differentiate China among its various parts, and aid only went to the underdeveloped provinces. However, its ever increasing GDP, and the speed at which it increases, has further discouraged the aid agencies from paying too much attention to China. Before long, China may fall into the grey area where its economic capacity is not adequate for it to join the donors' club, yet it is too rich to remain a recipient.

O-O-O-O-O

#### COLLOBORATIVE RESEARCH ON AID TO SOUTH AFRICAN EDUCATION AND TRAINING

George Subotzky Education Policy Unit, University of the Western Cape

A proposed collaborative project is being planned on aid to South African education and training, with a view to illuminating the key dynamics of changing north-south aid relations. The project will be conducted during 1998 in multiple northern and southern sites and will be co-ordinated by Prof Kenneth King (University of Edinburgh and NORRAG), Professor Joe Muller (University of Cape Town) and George Subotzky (University of the Western Cape). It will involve a number of associate researchers.

The project will examine past and emerging policies and practices of donor-South African relationships, and will track, inventory and assess the effects of various instances of donor involvement in education and training policy in South Africa between 1990 to 1998. The main concerns will be: aid co-ordination, donor aid policy, sustainability and capacity-building, the effectiveness of targeting the poor, and mutuality in aid relationships.

These will be examined against the backdrop of recent shifts in North-South relations and, in particular, the "new aid paradigm" which was characterised at the 1997 Oxford Conference. While available aid internationally is declining, demand is increasing, with more potential recipients competing for less resources. This has generated the need for clearly implementable policies, for greater sustainability and effectiveness, and for mutuality amongst aid partners. A greater convergence has emerged amongst Northern agencies in relation to development agendas and the political and trade agendas of their governments. Donors are now increasingly concerned to: 1) promote strong local ownership of policies; 2) relate aid to the presence of a supportive sectoral environment; 3) connect aid to a broader set of political and economic conditions.



For a number of reasons, the South African case is an interesting and informative one. Specific trends may be identified that could signal patterns yet to emerge more clearly elsewhere. With donors keen to avoid the pitfalls of the past, and with South Africa equally keen to conduct aid relationships on her own terms, this case study represents an opportunity for lessons for the North and South alike.

During the apartheid years, the government had no direct experience with conventional multilateral and bilateral aid. As a consequence, there were no fiscal or other mechanisms for dealing with aid. After the 1994 election, in an attempt to co-ordinate aid, all funding was routed through the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) office. However, many donors still dealt directly with the provinces and with community-based and community service organisations. With the demise of the RDP office, the future of aid co-ordination will be in the hands of the proposed National Development Agency (NDA).

South Africa is at once a relatively rich and a predominantly poor country and has strong internal features of centre/periphery relations between its national and provincial educational and financial governance structures. In these two senses, South Africa simultaneously displays features of the North and the South even though it is structurally a Southern country.

South Africa is perceived to have a more coherent policy development and delivery capacity than most other developing countries. It is thus seen as presenting an opportunity for attaining a model of greater mutuality in aid relations. Mutuality depends on effective capacity and on functioning mechanisms for receiving, allocating and disbursing aid. Where this is the case, valuable lessons can be learnt. But where problems in the policy partnership occur, the South African case will be useful in highlighting what conditions are necessary for achievement mutuality even where policy development capacity appears to be strong.

The strong South African view is that all multilateral and bilateral aid should be channelled through (or "added-in") to conventional departmental budgets, rather than "added-on" as special projects run in parallel to the main work of the department. This is a novel challenge to which the donors have so far responded with marked reluctance even though analysts have repeatedly made the case for "add-in" aid. Like many of their counterparts in the South, some in the new government are wary of donor interference and invasiveness. The aid community evidently remains keen not only to promote decentralisation but also to practice it.

NGOs are a critical barometer of aid policy and practice. The study will therefore examine both the transitional mechanisms for dealing with the huge NGO constituency (created in response to apartheid) as well as the NDA. A good deal of the hoped-for capacity will depend upon internal co-ordination between the Departments of Finance, Education, Labour and Arts and Culture, and the office of the Executive Deputy President in the case of the NDA. How this co-ordination operates will provide valuable insights into national capacity for dealing with Northern donors who espouse a "new realism" but who have to contend with systematically decreasing budgets.

The study will focus on the following areas:

- 1) Northern Development Agencies and their Southern Counterparts: a) Multilateral agencies; b) Bilateral agencies; c) NGOs; d) Foundations;
- 2) Donor/Government Relations and Policy Formulation: a) National Qualifications Framework and Curriculum 2005; b) National Commission on Higher Education; c) Donor/Provincial Government Relations in the province of the Northern Cape;

- 3) Inter- and Intra-Government Co-ordination: between the Departments of Finance, Education, Labour and Arts and Culture, and the NDA;
- 4) Inter-sectoral Projects and Programmes: a) Presidential Education Initiative; b) The Culture of Learning Project; c) The 1000 Schools' Project; d) TVET; e) Adult Literacy;
- 5) A Status Account of Agency Funding, to identify where aid has been targeted and where it has been received and in particular, how it has been distributed among the richer and poorer provinces.

The unique aspect of the research is that it will be a collaborative one, conducted in the North (involving the NORRAG network) and the South (at both national and provincial levels). An important aim of the project is to build capacity wherever possible and appropriate. Research assistants in both the North and the South will be employed and utilised in the study with special regard for providing learning opportunities for black and female researchers.

O-O-O-O-O

## THE BRAIN DRAIN/GAIN DIMENSION IN INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION

Binod Khadria, Jawaharlal Nehru University

International migration or mobility of people across countries is a phenomenon which is, ideally speaking, inherent in the idea of international education. International education can, therefore, in this context be understood as globalisation of knowledge and skills (of universal applicability) - through migration of (a) students for learning, and (b) educated workers for jobs overseas, respectively. But in terms of welfare implications, the *ex post* effects of such international migration have been mainly looked at as loss to the country of origin - of human capital - leading to "brain drain". The possibilities of "brain gain" from *ex ante* investments in international migration capabilities of individuals through promotion of international education have not, on the other hand, drawn much attention. This is despite the fact that *ex post* gains from remittances and technology transfer by the expatriates have often been debated. The two perspectives of drain and gain have remained vastly separated from each other as a result: Whereas the issue of brain drain, which dominated the international economic relations literature, has only marginally been discussed in the education fora, the issue of investment in international education has hardly been given a place in the economics discourse. The economics-of-education discourse on brain drain from developing to developed countries has, therefore, remained devoid of any significant discussion on the international development cooperation potential that underlie the brain drain/gain dimension of international education. There is increasing evidence of this state of thinking to change now:

Although the conventional pattern of brain drain from a developing country like India still persists through different channels, it has been pointed out that possibilities exist, now in the 1990s and beyond. The Indian diaspora can actually bring about a "return" of human capital to and within India even without the accompanying physical return of the "prodigal sons" who had drifted away to greener pastures as brain drain (Khadria, 1996).

In some other countries, the possibilities had started to appear earlier since the mid-1980s itself (Gaillard and Gaillard, 1997; Krishna and Khadria, 1997). A few of these are now reported to have turned the possibilities into actual achievements. For example, in the case of East Asian

countries, return of expatriate engineers, primarily from amongst those based in the USA, has been at the root of the turnaround that economies like South Korea experienced. In Latin America, introduction of new educational discipline like molecular biology in Argentina (Kreimer, 1997), or the basic sciences in Uruguay (Barreiro and Velho, 1997) were the results of the efforts put in by the returning expatriates towards internationalisation of science education. Apart from these, developments in telecommunications technologies have helped many a developing country in establishing links between its expatriate scientists and academics in the diaspora and its scientific and learning communities at home (Meyer et al., 1997).

The issue is not merely one of access to international capital (monetary remittances) or international technology (transfer of machines and equipments) through the diaspora. It is not even that of return migration *per se*. For the development objective particularly, the creation of capabilities for effective utilisation of international education and knowledge is the main issue. Such an objective requires optimum individual productivity - developed through collective learning. For this, the scope of education-related policy intervention must be widened to incorporate not only the role of primary education but primary health as well (Khadria, 1997). Possible international development cooperation between expatriate and resident nationals for innovative interactions in the developing country of origin provides the scope for international education to play a catalyst here. It thus calls for a major paradigm shift - to replace the expectations from exogenous return of resources (remittances, technology, manpower) with the capabilities of endogenous growth triggered by optimum utilisation of international education that the expatriates can foster. Such a perspective for international development cooperation would definitely alter the contours of international education in future - in response to a need for standardisation of curriculum content and quality. It is not impossible to decipher the tendency towards such change in the discourse on "knowledge for development" that is now emerging on the scene once again.

#### References:

- Khadria, B. (1996). Return of Human Capital -The second generation effects of brain drain, Times Fellowship Report, Times Fellowships Council, New Delhi, mimeo.
- From *Science, Technology & Society*, vol.2, no.2, 1997: Gaillard, J. and Gaillard, A. M. (1997). "Introduction: The international migration of brains: exodus or circulation?"
- Krishna, V. V. and Khadria, B. (1997). "Phasing scientific migration in the context of brain gain and brain drain in India."
- Kreimer, P. (1997). "Migration of scientists and the building of a laboratory in Argentina".
- Barreiro, A. and Velho, L. (1997). "The Uruguayan basic scientists migration and their academic articulation around the PEDECIBA."
- Meyer, J. B. et al. (1997). "Turning brain drain into brain gain: The Colombian experience".

O-O-O-O-O

## NEW DISSEMINATION STRATEGIES FOR THE WHITE PAPER

Kenneth King

It is instructive to set the most recent two White Papers on 'Development' side by side. The October 1975 document was a slightly larger than A5, modest-looking official text. On the front page the most striking feature is the Coat of Arms, and then the title with its two subtitles:

*Overseas Development: the changing emphasis in British aid policies: more help for the poorest* (Cmnd 6270) price 95p.

The text was single spaced; it ran to 70 pages. There was not a single diagram or table. There were however some annexes 'to help those who have little knowledge of the day-to-day working of the Ministry of Overseas Development'.

By contrast, the White Paper presented to Parliament in November 1997 is a large (A4) document on glossy paper, with a very striking title and then smaller subtitles:

*ELIMINATING WORLD POVERTY: a challenge for the 21st century: White Paper on international development* (Cmnd 3789) price £9.85, 82 pages.

The 1997 document is very accessible. There is a personal statement at the front from the Secretary of State for International Development, Clare Short. This is in plain English, in short sentences like 'We can succeed' and 'We all have a moral duty to reach out to the poor and needy'. But the whole text is presented in ways that make it easy to absorb and memorable.

There are, right up front, the four great sections, which then run colour-coded through the White Paper: The challenge of development; Building partnerships; Consistency of policies; and Building support for development. Conveniently, these produce a series of 12 major messages or threads. Effectively these become the storyline of the White Paper.

Unlike its 1975 predecessor, the 1997 paper is printed in double columns, 1.5 spacing; it is full of illustrative charts and diagrams, and many of its major sectoral issues are presented in boxed form with 'the challenge' followed by 'our response'. This is the case for the following sectoral areas of concern:

Water and Food; Education; Essential Health Care; Population; Basic Infrastructure;  
Income and Employment Opportunities; Good Governance, Corruption and the Rule of  
Law; Gender Inequalities; and Rights of the Child.

Full-page boxes, colour coded, are also used extensively throughout the rest of the text.

In terms of dissemination, there were originally 8,000 copies printed of the White Paper, and 3,000 of this first printing have been distributed through the Stationery Offices across the UK. DFID has used a significant number (5,000) for its own purposes. On a second printing of 3,500, DFID took 3,000, and 500 went to the Stationery Offices. There has been a healthy response to the White Paper and as of late January all but 100 of the 3,500 going out via the Stationery Office network had been sold.

Apart from the dissemination of the main White Paper, there has been a parallel printing of a Summary of the White Paper which has been distributed very widely and has been free. It is even more user friendly than the official White Paper. It is just 21 pages long, with lots of colour, and highlighting of the main messages.

No less than a quarter of a million of them were printed and they have been distributed on the advice of the Central Office of Information (Sponsorship and Promotions) through some of the main supermarkets (Sainsburys, Safeway, and Tesco). They have apparently gone like 'hot cakes', but it is probably very difficult to know what are the particular constituencies that have acquired them.

One group, students of development, certainly have, and there are instances of lecturers sending their students down to the local supermarket to get their own copies.

Presumably the reason for the double dissemination strategy is that it is integral to the fourth section of the White Paper - Building support for development. It is recognised that creating a constituency in favour of international development can itself build upon the existing traditions of popular support for NGOs working in the developing world. But the additional effort in this White Paper to promote development education and development awareness in the UK is driven by a desire for openness, accountability, and a greater readiness to give political support for raising a national development budget that had declined from .51% of GNP to .27% of GNP over the past 18 years.

Even though this fourth section of the White Paper is by far the shortest (just 4 pages), it has ambitious targets also. It will, for instance, be an enormous help to the small development education centres around the UK to have the White Paper state so unequivocally:

Every child should be educated about development issues, so that they can understand the key global considerations which will shape their lives (4:3).

We will work to ensure that global issues are integrated into the national curriculum and that the relevant teaching materials are available (4:4).

There is recognition also that Britain is itself a multicultural country and accordingly the Summary of the White Paper is going to become available in Bengali, Gujarati, Hindi, Punjabi, Urdu and Chinese.

Finally in dissemination terms, the full White Paper is available on the Web Site:

<http://www.oneworld.org/dfid>

O-O-O-O-O

**TARGETING POVERTY, FOCUSING AID**

Keith Watson, University of Reading

Reading the most recent British Government's White Paper on international development, *Eliminating World Poverty: A Challenge for the 21st Century* (Stationery Office, 1997) apart from the presumption of the title one is immediately struck by a sense of déjà vu as well as a sense of deep disappointment. In the early years of a previous Labour Administration not only did the then Minister for Overseas Development, Judith Hart, produce a White Paper entitled *The Changing Emphasis in British Aid Policies: More Help for the Poorest* (HMSO, 1975) but it addressed many of the same issues as the new one. The sense of déjà vu comes therefore right at the beginning since the opening paragraph of chapter one of the 1975 policy document reads as follows:

The improvement in the living standards of the world's poor is one of the major challenges of our time: it will remain a challenge for at least the rest of this century and perhaps well into the next. In 1975 it is possible to look back over the last 25 years of national and international development efforts and to claim that much has been achieved (HMSO 1975: 3).

The 1997 document makes similar statements, e.g.

In the last 50 years more people have escaped from poverty than in the previous 500 years of human existence (DFID 1997).

Yet the truth is that the numbers in absolute poverty (i.e. Those who earn less than \$1 per day or less than \$365 per annum) have actually risen from 700 million to over 1.3 billion during that time. Global demographic growth, which has seen the global population rise from 4.5 billion to nearly 6 billion during this period is partly to blame. The impact of economic globalisation and policies of structural adjustment, which impact most unfavourably on the marginalised and economically disadvantaged, are also partly to blame. The adjustment upwards of what constitutes 'absolute poverty' has also had an impact. In 1975 the definition was someone who had an income of less than \$200 per annum; in 1997 it was that of an income of less than \$350 per annum. The cynic could well argue that by playing around with statistics, rather than seeing individual human lives behind each of these statistics, which is what Robert S. MacNamara, President of the World Bank from 1968-81, is accused of doing (George and Sabeli, 1994), one could easily meet DFID's target of 'halving the proportion of people living in extreme poverty by 2015'. However this is not the issue: the issue is the lack of intellectual rigour in the current UK government's White Paper on International Development.

"Eliminating World Poverty" reads more like a party political manifesto than a serious policy document. It is full of assertions, (we shall do this, we shall achieve that etc.), of pious statements with which few people would disagree, of jibes at the previous government's record on aid and development, of sweeping and patronising statements. Government White Papers were traditionally well thought out policy documents, based on a clear philosophy and academic reasoning; they were not documents aimed at point scoring against previous administrations, although this now seems to be the pattern of new Labour's policy statements as the White Papers on such issues as health care, education (eg 'Excellence in Schools') and the environment would indicate.

More tragically, however, is the superficiality of thinking and the failure to learn from previous failures. 'More Help for the Poorest' addressed many of the same issues highlighted in 'Eliminating World Poverty' -- the justification for aid, the environment, health care, rural development etc. - and while it was also strongly influenced by the then recent World Bank sector policy papers on education, health and rural development there was also evidence of a

coherent and independent level of argument. There was a substantive discussion on education, urban development, demographic growth, world food problems, the difficulties arising from the current global financial difficulties, co-operation with other donor agencies etc. The current White Paper largely ignores the impact of globalisation, draws heavily on UNDP and World Bank analyses, superficially addresses the issues of trade, agriculture, the environment and population growth and adheres to current thinking about conditionality. It barely mentions education, though to be fair this will be developed in a subsequent Education Policy Paper.

Where it does move the debate forward is in its recognition of the need to, and its commitment to, reduce the debts of the poorest countries; in its recognition of the importance of nutrition, health care and support for mothers and young children; in its concern for gender equality; in its commitment to restore the British government's development assistance to the UN's target of 0.7% of GNP by 2002; and by its support for Development Education (ie. raising awareness of development issues) amongst the public and school children.

What it does not do, however, is to examine why the previous Labour government's policies of targetting assistance to the poorest groups in the poorest societies failed, and thus explain how the new policies will succeed where others have failed. The problems usually lie in inadequate administrative mechanisms, poor lines of communication between the central government and the rural poor or a political unwillingness to confront the issue of the urban poor because of the financial implications. Even talking about 'partnerships' between governments does not really solve this dilemma, especially if a poor country government believes that its priorities do not immediately lie with targeting the poor. This is particularly true in an increasingly volatile and global market where sometimes the name of the game is simply survival with the result that the poor suffer even more. Only by closer collaboration with NGOs and local communities is assistance most likely to be poverty focused, though even here there is no guarantee. There is now considerable evidence from Africa, Asia and Latin America that the localisation of decision making and the presence of parents/ community representatives on school councils or governing bodies does NOT automatically benefit the poor: indeed it might work against their interests because the educated classes become the representatives and their first priority is to serve their own group interests.

In terms of focusing development assistance towards education, both formal and nonformal, with the intention of eliminating poverty, much work needs to be done. The mechanisms of HOW such assistance is going to be targeted, of HOW its impact is to be measured, and of WHERE it is likely to be most successful MUST BE addressed urgently if yet more money is not to be squandered and if cynicism is not to increase. It is to be hoped that some of these issues will be addressed in the forthcoming White Paper on education and development, but that remains to be seen.

## References

Department for International Development (1997) *Eliminating World Poverty: a Challenge for the 21st century*. London, The Stationery Office Ltd.

George, S and Sabeli, F (1994) *Faith and Credit: The World Bank's Secular Empire*, Harmondsworth, Penguin Books

Ministry of Overseas Development (1975) *Overseas Development: the Changing Emphasis in British Aid Policies: More Help for the Poorest*. London, HMSO

## THE WHITE PAPER AND SUSTAINABLE LIVELIHOODS

Camilla Toulmin, International Institute for Environment and Development (IIED), Edinburgh

Preparation of the new Labour Government's White Paper on overseas development *Eliminating World Poverty* has provided a much-needed opportunity for the many people involved with international development issues in the UK to feed ideas and information into the process. While some NGOs have been critical of the lack of concrete quantified commitments, most have been greatly pleased to see a statement of new priorities and the desire of the UK to engage positively with the global debate on aid, sustainability and development. John Prescott's shuttle diplomacy prior to the Kyoto summit is one demonstration of such a commitment.

Promotion of sustainable livelihoods features prominently throughout the White Paper and it is this emphasis I want to look at here. As in the run-up to Rio in 1992, when the term sustainable development was found decorating every available text, sustainable livelihoods have more recently come to symbolise one of the primary goals of development co-operation. Such an emphasis has grown out of the discovery of *social capital*, thanks to researchers like Robert Putnam on N. and S. Italy - and others, and the recognition that institutions and social networks really matter in enabling access to resources for poorer people. A tidal wave of research students has been unleashed on many unsuspecting communities in the developing world to study and measure degrees of social capital, to support or refute the claims made by this new school of thought. But, regardless of academic debate, DFID, must also think through the meaning of such a focus on sustainable livelihoods for the choices they face in their aid programme.

Judging by *Eliminating World Poverty*, they have identified many of the important issues and trade-offs which must be considered. The White Paper identifies several key elements which underlie such an emphasis on sustainable livelihoods, and provide the broader context within which aid policy and practice must operate, which include:

- i) the need to understand the linkages between micro-level opportunities for poor people and what happens at national and global levels. At global level, it is increasingly clear that our futures are linked whether in the North or the South. The prosperity and stability of poor countries will be critical to maintaining a viable life on our planet in the next century. Developed countries have it in their power to open up many more opportunities for poorer countries, but it remains to be seen whether domestic considerations will allow this to happen.
- ii) livelihoods are diverse and continuously adapting to changes in local circumstances. Thus, attempts to support such livelihoods must recognise their niche development and their dynamic quality. Instead of, say, providing support for a pre-determined intervention, local people need to be given the capacity to develop skills and economic activities which suit their individual circumstances. Decentralised control and management of this process by local people is key.
- iii) in contrast to the dogmatism of recent years, which has emphasised the need to withdraw the state's involvement from most areas of economic life, the White Paper argues for balance between the government and private sectors. It acknowledges that in the 60s and 70s many states tried to intervene far too much and often hindered the very growth they professed to desire. Achieving economic growth at minimal environmental cost is now seen as critical to attain the rise in income levels needed to make a major impact on poverty. Governments can



play an important role in creating a framework within which new opportunities can flourish but it is also right for them to temper and direct such growth for the pursuit of social objectives.

iv) Partnership is offered between the UK and those governments serious in taking forward a poverty focused agenda. Where such commitments exist, the White Paper promises that a flexible and long term commitment of resources will follow on the UK side.

It all looks good and a welcome change of rhetoric. Some people cringe at the emphasis on poverty targets that are felt to be unrealistic, and others would question the value of continued emphasis on drawing up further environmental plans and strategies. Each new statement of principle raises a number of serious questions which will need to be addressed, like where and how is the balance achieved between economic growth and more equitable and sustainable livelihoods? All donors are currently keen on decentralisation as a process expected to bring real benefits to poorer groups by bringing them closer to decision-making centres, but there are only too many opportunities for such empowerment to be a mirage. However, these are details which will have to be worked out depending on context. There is an honest fervour behind the new mandate and an openness to debate with which no-one can argue.

O-O-O-O-O

#### THE WHITE PAPER AND PARTNERSHIP

Roger Riddell, Overseas Development Institute, London.

The concept of 'partnership' is central to the White Paper. The term is used principally to refer to a partnership in the aid relationship between Britain and the governments of developing countries, but also covers partnership between the British Government on one hand and British business, NGOs and the research community on the other. Put simply, the bargain on offer to developing countries is this: commit yourself to poverty reduction and good government, and in return you can expect a longer term commitment from DFID, more money and greater flexibility in the use of resources. It is the Government's stated wish that this long-term partnership-relationship is developed with most major aid recipients and thus that most aid is transferred in the context of this new structure: 'The Government expects to have such partnerships with many of the very poor countries of sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia' (para 2.21). In broad terms, the prominence given to partnership - as opposed to aid conditionality - is to be warmly welcomed. What remains to be addressed is precisely how the concept will be "operationalised" in practice.

The White Paper describes partnership in very general terms. It is not yet specific about the modalities of cooperation. Once these are tackled, there will be many practical questions to answer. On the question of reciprocal rights and obligations, the White Paper is effectively silent. However, DFID will surely agree that partnership involves sharing: if two parties meet on equal terms to discuss and agree a set of mutual rights and obligations on issues of mutual concern, the combined inter-action of the process and the (agreed) outcome can legitimately be described as building a partnership.

There are a number of risks involved in building a partnership when one party takes the lead in drawing up the criteria for partnership. One is that the views, perspectives, sensitivities, values

and priorities of the other partner will be under- or mis-represented. Indeed, the growing acknowledgement of the importance of incorporating the insights of different stakeholders at the project level is evidence of the importance which aid administrations throughout the world have attached to this set of insights. A related risk is that without this input, the partner drawing up the contract assumes the criteria s/he draws up will be the 'correct ones'. In the context of the White Paper, the danger is that potential partners may read the UK's approach to partnership from this perspective as saying the following: 'We know how best to achieve development. We know how you should alleviate poverty. Either you accept the approaches which we think are right for you or you will not qualify for a long-term partnership with us. If you do not accept our view of development, then we will not provide you with aid.' To the extent that this view is held, there would seem to be little difference between this interpretation of partnership and more traditional views on conditionality.

Putting ideas of partnership into practice raises many practical issues. First, if the aid relationship is to be (radically) different in countries in which there is a long-term partnership relationship from those in which there is not, then it will be necessary to classify recipients into different groups depending upon the broad criteria for partnership outlined in the White Paper. What weight should be given to the different criteria? Is it necessary to meet all the criteria? Are some more important than others? Is it necessary to meet some minimum standard for all criteria or can a good rating for some to give a satisfactory overall score ensure one passes the grade even if/when one just misses the bench-mark for other criteria? Thirdly, and relatedly, what method will be used to assess performance against each of these different criteria?

This, in turn, raises a crucial question about transparency. The White Paper does not say either whether it will publish a list of countries which fall within the different classifications of partnership, or whether it will publish the ratings which it gives on each criteria for the different countries concerned. There are three powerful reasons for urging transparency on both these counts. First, unless there is a minimal degree of transparency in rating and ranking recipients, the Government will leave itself open to the charge that it has either used other criteria to classify countries or that it has allocated different weights to different countries; in other words, that it has acted arbitrarily. Secondly, to the extent that recipients see value in being classified as a long-term partner - not least because the aid given will have fewer strings (conditions) attached - details of where they are failing will provide information with which to narrow gaps if they so desire. Thirdly, it would seem to be fundamentally contradictory to talk about and give such emphasis to the notion of partnership and then not provide data and information to would-be partners on the way they are being judged.

Yet another issue which remains ambiguous and requires further clarification is the importance which the Government attaches to needs vis-a-vis performance and results. The White Paper's focus on poverty is based on the view that aid should be provided on the basis of need and the lack of resources to meet those needs - hence the prime focus on poor countries in which there are many poor people. However, the White Paper appears to place greater emphasis on results than commitment and suggests that the failure to achieve results and the failure to demonstrate commitment to the elimination of poverty are likely to provide sufficient conditions to down-grade the partnership relationship and even to provide the basis for reducing aid flows. It would seem important both that the issues and dilemmas are given greater clarity as the Government moves to operationalise its partnership ideas, but also that they are debated further within the wider aid community.

The concerns expressed here are far from academic: in practice it may not be easy for recipients and potential recipients to buy into the partnership idea, even when the donor tries its hardest

to involve the recipient. The more recipients buy into the partnership 'game' the more likely they are to feel that they are being boxed into a corner created, in many respects, by themselves. The essence of the problem is that each side is interested in entering into an agreement which provides it with the maximum amount of flexibility for itself but which also provides it with the greatest assurance that the other will act in a predictable way. Given this dilemma, and the fact that the partnership is rooted in inequality because of the resources which will be passed from one side (the donor) to the other (recipient), it is apparent that there are major hurdles to be overcome in the effort to flesh the rhetoric of partnership into the reality of a working relationship. The White Paper is to be praised by giving emphasis to the notion of partnership. In many ways, it has completed the easy part: the difficult bits still have to be addressed.

O-O-O-O-O

### DFID'S WHITE PAPER AND EDUCATION

Myra Harrison, Education Division, DFID, London

Universal Primary Education (UPE) is a goal for all nations, the poorer and the developed, as a right for all children, as a contributing factor in development and as the means to improve health, livelihoods, and well being. DFID has adopted it as a target for 2015.

This goal is a huge challenge and will need creative thought and constructive dialogue with partner countries to ensure a shared vision for the future. We will not shirk from the challenge - we accept education as a key component in reducing, and ultimately eliminating, poverty. The two go hand in hand.

DFID already embraces the expanded vision of the Jomtien Conference on Education for All in 1990 - universal access and equity, a focus on learning, broadening basic education to include literacy for adults, and strengthening partnerships. We are committed to the 21<sup>st</sup> century targets, and take them all seriously.

Governments also have a crucial role to play - in developing effective policies and making resource decisions to promote UPE. DFID will emphasise support to those countries which are making efforts to get all their children into schools - girls as well as boys, rural children as well as city-dwellers, the children of the poor as well as the wealthy, and those in socially or ethnically disadvantaged communities.

A further challenge is that of the 900 million adults world-wide who are illiterate. Two-thirds of them are women. They all deserve a chance to participate in learning, and to develop their potential to participate fully in decision-making that affects them. DFID will support governments' or community literacy programmes aimed at eradicating illiteracy.

At the other end of the education scale, the nature of IT and the globalisation of technological and scientific knowledge mean that poorer countries will face a widening gap in their economic development vis a vis developed countries - unless they are able to bridge it. This will mean investing resources first in basic education for all and also in opportunities for higher skills developed in order to achieve competitiveness. Distance Education is likely to assume an increasingly important share of education provision at all levels.

DFID recognises the role of higher levels of learning and skills acquisition in preparing individuals and their institutions to participate in development and the elimination of poverty. We shall continue to support academic partnerships and scholarships where they contribute to the overarching goals of development and poverty reduction.

DFID will not attempt to go it alone in pursuing these goals with poorer countries. We shall seek to strengthen our partnerships with other bilateral and multilateral donors, especially the World Bank and European Union, in support of this work.

The UK has rejoined UNESCO and intends to play a full part in the work it does in support of education. We are also committed members of the Commonwealth, and will continue to contribute to the Commonwealth Scholarship and Fellowship Plan for academic interchange, and to its distance education network, the Commonwealth of Learning.

O-O-O-O-O

#### THE DFID WHITE PAPER - A CRITIQUE

Martha Caddell, Institute for the Study of Education & Society, Edinburgh of University

Firstly, the novelty of this document must be acknowledged. Specifically, it is the first time that a summary document has been produced with the intention of such wide distribution and, as the first White Paper since that prepared by Judith Hart in 1975, it is the only time in my life that a government statement at this level has referred to questions of international development.

It is also apparent, however, that its role is primarily as a vision statement, as opposed to a concrete expression of planned initiatives. While accepting this I wish to voice some concerns and raise a number of questions related both to the substantive content of the documents and the purpose of the summary document in particular.

One area of concern is the vocabulary used within both documents, which incorporate a number of terms which have come to dominate the rhetoric of development policy in recent years. Many of these terms and concepts have become vacuous and largely devoid of either descriptive or analytic rigour.

For example, the emphasis on the coherence of policies has received increased consideration over recent years, with little attention to the implications this may have for creativity or flexibility in policy development and programme implementation. Specifically, will 'coherence' in relation to the international community imply following uncritically the dominant ideology of development, with its specific views of the role of education within this process? Also, such a position is likely to lead to wider demands being made on those countries that Britain is seeking to support. Thus concern with 'good governance' - particularly the strengthening of 'democratic societies and market economies' (Summary, p10) - will either be explicitly raised as a condition of assistance or implicitly encouraged by the redirection of support from uncooperative governments to 'other organisations like voluntary agencies or local government'.

The concept of 'partnerships' also raises several questions. While there is emphasis on the need for 'genuine partnerships', perhaps in recognition of previous disparity of opportunity in such relationships, it is still unclear what level of parity or equality constitutes such an affiliation. From the description provided one could suggest these will merely maintain and reinforce existing North - South relations with the chosen terminology serving once again to mask underlying asymmetries in access to resources and decision making processes.

In relation to the expressed priorities of the DFID, particular concern can be expressed over the targets set for the education sector. In line with earlier international agreements, notably the DAC's report on development co-operation, the achievement of UPE has once again been further delayed. In addition, the timetable for the achievement of gender equality in education and the attaining of UPE seems highly illogical. It would seem more appropriate to suggest that the only way in which such equality can be achieved is through UPE and not the converse, as is claimed in the White Paper. Thus the 10 year disparity between the two targets must be questioned.

At both national and international level one can see a further reason why this is an important document as it sets up clear area of difference between the new Labour government and the out going Conservative regime. In particular it places considerable emphasis on the need for co-operation with the international community, with explicit mention given to the EU, Commonwealth and UN. The contrast between the outgoing and incoming governments is emphasised implicitly - and in places explicitly - throughout the documents. Hence, the document can be regarded as sending a clear message not only about development policy but about Britain's changing role in the international arena more generally.

Also, in this discussion of poverty, the implicit referent against which development is being measured is the North - specifically Britain. Thus 'the poor' are constructed as distinct from 'us', the British public, who are seen as being able to eliminate it. In creating such a picture of the developing world and the 'poorest countries' the documents are also constructing a vision of the 'New Britain' which we are led to believe is emerging. Corruption, conflict and dispute, bribery and poverty itself are represented primarily as problems of others, which we in the UK can help them tackle. Such discursive construction of 'development problems', and the impact this has on policy formulation and implementation, deserves further extrapolation.

#### Dissemination of the White Paper

An area of particular interest is the purpose of producing and distributing the summary document. It is significant that DFID was the first government department to publish a White Paper and also the first to, at least ostensibly, seek public legitimation for its policies through the distribution of a summary paper. Was this a consequence of its role as a new Ministry, or a reflection of the commitment of the individuals involved? One must question why no similar summary was produced for the Education or Devolution White Papers, issues which, it could be argued, impact more directly on the everyday lives of the British public.

Certainly, one important reason behind the aim of widespread dissemination of information is the need to encourage interest and ensure support for what could potentially be a contentious policy area. It is interesting to recall the tabloid media outcry after National Lottery money went to overseas development projects, a reaction which may have influenced the decision to attempt 'to win stronger public and international support for the fight against poverty' (Summary, p11)

The summary was clearly produced with its key focus on the local constituency - ie the British taxpayer who will be expected to finance this increased concern with development issues. The

use of inclusive language, emphasising the strength of the country's global position appears to be a key tool in this enterprise. For example, 'In Britain we've always responded to emergencies around the world, helping reduce suffering and saving lives' (Summary p10). Thus both Britain's position within the international community is established and the role of the individual in achieving these goals is emphasised.

Finally it is important to question who the intended audience was for this summary document and how effectively it has been targeted and distributed to them.

In an attempt to reach a large audience and to expand interest in the White Paper, copies of the summary were distributed to a number of supermarkets across the country - with Tesco, Safeway and Sainsbury in particular participating. In addition it was also made available through branches of Oxfam and HMSO Bookshops. However, in a brief survey of stores in Edinburgh it was discovered only one had heard of and been given copies of the summary report. In this case the branch manager had been invited to a meeting with George Foulkes in October to launch the initiative and 40 copies had been presented to him. The store did not have any intention to order more. It is interesting to note that of the 250,000 copies of the summary produced the number estimated, by DFID officers, to have been sent to stores ranges from 20,000 to 100,000. Even this latter number seems fairly insignificant if the intention was to promote widespread public interest in the document.

There also appears to be some disparity in the timing of the distribution of the document with stores in London receiving them earlier than other parts of the country. It would also appear that - unsurprisingly - the interest expressed in the document varied notably in relation to the social class area served by the stores. If support for development programmes is to expand it is imperative that material is made relevant and accessible to a wider audience.

It is important to question whether, if the intention was to raise awareness of development issues among a new audience, a 21 page summary document was the best medium to use. One issue must surely be the cost, or rather the perceived cost, of producing such a document. As charity fundraisers are increasingly discovering, the public express real concern when they believe money is being excessively spent on administration and the production of materials as opposed to on direct project expenditure. Surely the DFID runs similar risks. Also, it could be suggested that a brightly coloured, short leaflet distributed to a larger number of people - perhaps through newspapers - or a poster or television advertising campaign may have been more effective if raising widespread public support was the prime objective.

The summary can, however, be seen as a useful resource for NGOs in that it allows easy reference and thus will encourage wider reading than the full White Paper could command within this audience. It provides a basis for making claims on government, particularly for resources. In the field of development education, which is given considerable emphasis in the document, a number of NGOs have expressed a hope that the government's commitment will lead to funds being directed towards these activities, thus reducing some of the pressure on their own resources.

Clearly one can be critical of both the substantive aims of the document and whether it has fulfilled the expressed objective to engage public support and interest. However, from a pragmatic, practically oriented view, both the full White Paper and the summary document offer a clear basis from which to hold the government accountable for its actions and to make demands upon it to take further measures to address issues related to poverty and

development. How the White Paper is now used by various interest groups is possibly as important an issue to discuss as what it contains.

(My thanks to Jennifer Christie, Ian Coyne and Christina Wong for their comments and suggestions on this article. M.C.)

## EDUCATION IN THE EAST AFRICAN REGION - HOW THE WHITE PAPER INFLUENCES DFID'S FUTURE ACTIVITIES

Shona Wynd, DFID, Nairobi

The Department for International Development's White Paper was the product of a long process of consultation, drafting and rewriting. As the title, *Eliminating World Poverty: A Challenge for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, indicates, at the core of the document is a commitment not just to the reduction of poverty, but to its elimination. Since its release in November, the White Paper has received a very favourable response. Recently at a DAC conference on "Partnerships", the document was cited as a positive example of a focused development strategy.

Clearly, the challenge is to now move beyond the theoretical implications of the document and to begin to act. In order to ensure that the document became a platform for action, the government committed itself to the international development targets that have been laid out by the Development Assistance Committee of the OECD. By signing up to these targets DFID has now become an organisation which is not only committed to addressing issues of poverty in every project or programme with which it is involved, but it will now have to monitor its own movement against the targets and, in so doing, demonstrate movement towards the goal of the elimination of poverty.

In East Africa, the White Paper's commitment to poverty reduction reinforces a trend which had already begun to develop in the Education Sector. Our emphasis is very much on the development of a Partnership approach to addressing educational development. In practice this means that we are taking an approach which places a heavy emphasis on the need for governments to have their own strongly and clearly articulated education development agenda before we can hope to have long term change. Within that agenda, if the government is truly committed to the reduction of poverty, there should be a set of strategies which set out to address the central challenge of ensuring that all children (and girls in particular) are able to access basic education by 2015.

In the cases of both Uganda and Tanzania, we have been supporting the development of Education Sector Strategies which clearly spell out how governments envisage their own education sector's evolution. In Kenya we have been supporting the development of an Education Master Plan. The process of developing these documents has been and continues to be slow, but the speed must be dictated by the governments' own capacities.

In each case, the Ministry of Education officials endeavouring to work toward the goal of UPE have been challenged with very difficult and delicate decision-making processes. In order to ensure that, at the very least, every child has access to an opportunity to achieve a basic education, inefficient systems must be made efficient. In order to ensure that all the poor and the very poor are given a chance, resources must be taken away from sub-sectors, which may be important, but are not currently a priority. Clearly not all of the sacrifices and changes will be politically popular and there will be a certain amount of reaction. Difficult decisions such as

teacher rationalisation or increasing teacher-student ratios must be owned by governments not only to ensure that they are ultimately carried out, but in order that the government is in a strong position to defend them when the negative criticisms are raised.

The second crucial element of our Partnership strategy is developing more effective and transparent relationships with other donors - both bilateral and multilateral. In order for the governments to have the time and a sufficiently stable environment within which to develop their strategies, the donors must respect the process. In both Uganda and Tanzania the donors have come together to support the process and have endeavoured to develop a more efficient system of communication between themselves. This involves regular meetings and a more open sharing of information. Tensions do exist and holding the donor line is not always easy given that each has its own spending targets and obligations to fulfil. However, on the whole, the donor community is very much committed to supporting the process.

0-0-0-0-0



**PARTNERSHIP AFRICA - A NEW SWEDISH APPROACH**

Lennart Wohlgemuth, The Nordic African Institute, Uppsala

In response to the major reforms which have taken place in Africa in the 1990s the policies of external actors are being revisited and changed. The time of total conditionalities and donor intervention is, if not over, more and more questioned - at least by the poor record in implementing programmes and projects supported from outside. The concept of "ownership" has been on the agenda for quite some time and is, at least in the Nordic countries, taken seriously.

In a number of countries the present policy towards the South and in particular towards Africa is being revised. Below follows an example from a recent exercise in Sweden.

The present Government in Sweden has made it clear that the relationship between Sweden and Africa has to be revisited. Two major reasons have been cited. Firstly, the successful policy of supporting the struggle for liberation and against apartheid over a period of more than 30 years, which dominated Swedish foreign as well as development policies over that period, has come to an end. Secondly, studies, research and evaluations all point at the fact that a paradigm shift is necessary in the relations between countries in the North and their African counterparts if aid to Africa is ever to become effective.

A study was commissioned by the Government of Sweden to oversee the Swedish overall policy towards Africa under the name of "Partnership Africa". The Nordic Africa Institute made a state of the art study on different policy areas such as aid, trade, capital flows, EU policies towards Africa, capacity building etc as a background to the major exercise and a great number of specific studies were commissioned mainly to African representatives of academia, NGOs, Governments and the private sector. Two major conferences were held; one in Abidjan, in collaboration with the African Development Bank, with 30 outspoken Africans, mainly researchers, and one in Stockholm on a more political level. The results are published in two anthologies and one report- which eventually will lead to a Government White Paper.

The question presented to the African participants was what role they see for a small country in Europe vis à vis Africa in the next century. The response was very revealing and refreshing. The African representatives were very clear on their hopes and demands for a "substantial" change in the relationship between the countries in the North and Africa - concerning geopolitical questions as well as the behaviour in the day to day relationship when it comes to bilateral affairs. The discussion concentrated on the latter and some concrete proposals were made. The major point made is so evident but so difficult to implement namely, that all agreements should be proceeded by a **real negotiation** where both parties give and take and where no one dictates the conditions for the other. This is a new but more concrete way of expressing ownership. After having taken part in all the discussions and confrontations during the period of the study, it is my strong belief that Africans will not accept being treated in the future as they presently are in their bilateral relationships. Adebayo Olukoshi, a senior researcher at the Nordic Africa Institute, expresses this very succinctly in his synthesis of the presentations made on partnership at the Abidjan conference as follows:

As the 20th century draws to a close, there is a new generation which is emerging out of the ashes of crisis and decline in Africa. It is a self-assured generation that is prepared to engage the world on equal terms. Its faith in the continent is deep-rooted and its determination to make Africa a home of which Africans can be proud is clear. That generation consists of people who are confident of themselves and are driven by a zeal to transform Africa both internally and in terms of its relationship with the rest of the world. It is a generation that is acutely aware of the potential of Africa and the obstacles within and outside the continent that must be surmounted in order for that potential to be fully realised. Its goal can be roughly described as entailing a quest for enthronement of developmental democracies in Africa. Under the leadership of this new generation, I envisage a situation where support from the international community will be welcome in the task of rebuilding Africa but not on any terms or at any cost, least of all on conditions drawn up and imposed from outside in a one-sided manner. If need be, this generation is prepared to go it alone and the world should be willing to let it be—if the international community is not prepared to listen to and respect the self-articulated hopes and aspirations of these Africans, then it should, at least, not obstruct them. In a sense, that was a central message that flowed out of the formal and informal discussions that took place in Abidjan; donors will do well to heed it.

Will Sweden, or for that matter any country in the North, adhere to this important message? I really hope so! At least the people who requested this report in Sweden are sincere in their quest for change. But when other interests compete it is always easy to forget the good intentions. The Swedish Vice Minister for Development Co-operation, Mats Karlsson, said in summing up the Abidjan conference that he hoped the Swedish government would see partnership as involving the following seven characteristics:

1. **A subject-to-subject attitude.** There is need for a real change of attitude.
2. **Being explicit about values.** You cannot engage in a partnership without sharing values and sincerity in the relationship is particularly important - a major element that has certainly often been lacking.
3. **Transparency in interests.** Even if interests diverge - and interests may conflict without that necessarily being something malevolent - one can strike deals and find common ground. In a partnership, negotiations are best made when interests are placed squarely on the table.
4. **Clear standards.** The new contractual relationship should focus on the critical factors for success, and avoid the plethora of conditionalities that now bedevil the politics of co-operation.
5. **Stick to the agreements.** The reverse side of clear contractual standards is that they must be upheld by both parties. Backtracking by the African partner must not be dealt with by misplaced acceptance. If real problems arise, they should be faced jointly, but there should be no room for an essentially paternalistic and humiliating attitude in the face of unwarranted backtracking on an agreement.
6. **Equality of capacity.** In entering a fair contract, both parties need to be in equal command of all the issues included in the contract. The aid relationship may be inherently unequal - one has money, the other does not - but you can have and essentially must have equality in terms of the capacity to analyse and judge the terms of a contract. In a development partnership, that capacity has to be broadly exercised in society.
7. **A code of conduct.** Perhaps the qualitative aspects should be made more explicit in order to provide a basis for, and further develop the modalities of partnership.

Taking these recommendations seriously would surely make a great change in the relationship between countries in the North and in Africa.

O-O-O-O-O

**SOME REFLECTIONS ON PARTNERSHIP, BASED ON THE REPORT ON SWEDEN'S  
FUTURE RELATIONS WITH AFRICA.**

Ingemar Gustafsson, Sida, Stockholm

A Swedish contribution to the concept of partnership comes in a recent report on Sweden's future relations with Africa. It is the result of the work of a team within the Ministry for Foreign Affairs. It is meant to be followed by a position paper later on. What we have so far is a report not a policy. Nevertheless, the report which is entitled "Partnership with Africa" signals some important changes.

According to the report the partnership "in a new Swedish policy should denote a Swedish endeavour, in co-operation with African partners, to establish a more equal and respectful relationship. In this partnership, both African and Swedish resources should be so utilised that the African parties become the subjects of their own reform measures rather than the objects of external decisions"(p. 19).

The key words here are "equal" and "respectful". Partnership in relation to the latter is a moral code of conduct which relates to values and attitudes more than to the structural problems of inequality that are typical of the aid-relationship.

It sets up a code of conduct for Sweden which could be marked by an endeavour to listen and by openness but also by clarity as regards the objectives of the co-operation. It is implied that Sweden expects its partners to respond with the same kind of transparency.

It should be noted then that this code of conduct does not only apply to development co-operation. The whole report is an attempt to shape and widen Sweden's overall relationship with Africa in the commercial, scientific and cultural fields.

This is where the term "equal" comes in. The analysis of the aid relationship recognises that aid dependency has increased rather than decreased. One way out, the report suggests, is to widen relationships to include areas where equality and mutual learning can take place, such as culture. The report suggests that special funds should be set aside for cultural exchange and cooperation within the aid budget. (Something Sida thinks can be promoted within the regular programme). It is also hoped that many of the Sida-funded activities, e.g. between universities, can be gradually transformed to regular forms of co-operation driven by the interests that both parties have to learn from each other. Whether this is a viable proposition or not remains to be seen. But it is a way to overcome the structural problems that are built in to the aid relationship and which are discussed, for example, in the Delors Commission report. My personal experience suggests that a lot can be done already within the context of the code of conduct. Too often, the structural inequality has led agencies to take a patronising attitude which is not justified.

Professional co-operation with institutions is one framework for a more businesslike relationship marked by respect. The experience from the Association for the Development of Education in Africa, ADEA, also illustrates that it is possible to come a long way towards a genuine partnership through professionalism and an attitude of collegiality. Even if the report on this point underlines what is the essence of any sound human relationship, it is important that this is done. Even if new relationships are being established, the review also shows that

aid is a very important component of Sweden's relationship with Africa. The challenge of the notion of partnership, therefore, is to deal with it within the framework of development co-operation. What do we do when the different agendas of implementation do not match? That remains the challenge ahead.

O-O-O-O-O

#### THE RESEARCH CHALLENGE IN THE NEW PARTNERSHIP

M R Bhagavan, Senior Research Adviser, Sida

Within the framework of Swedish development cooperation, the practice of partnership in research is over two decades old, beginning in the mid 1970s with the establishing of the then Swedish Agency for Research Cooperation with Developing Countries (SAREC). That approach carries on within the new Sida, which was created in July 1995 and into which the erstwhile SAREC has been integrated as a Department for Research Cooperation. The main result of this partnership has been the building up and strengthening of research capacity in several countries in Africa, Asia and Latin America. The principal vehicle of this endeavour was, and continues to be, long-term cooperation between university departments and research institutions in a developing country and Sweden. At present over 120 Swedish university departments and research institutions are involved in this effort in about ten developing countries, six of whom are in East and Southern Africa.

Given the fact that Swedish universities are so much stronger, in terms of resources, infrastructure, capacity and competence, than their African counterparts, considerable asymmetry in the partnership relationship has been inevitable. One of the main roles of the former SAREC was, and of the present Sida is, precisely to mitigate the negative consequences of this unequal situation, by judiciously mediating the partnership relationship (for an exposition of the challenges involved in this task, see M R Bhagavan, *The SAREC Model*, SAREC Report 1992:1).

The developing world has changed radically over the last few decades, in higher education and research as much as in other sectors of society and economy. In parts of Asia and Latin America ("the strong South"), the state has invested large resources at all levels of education and in R&D, helping to create, among other things, a firm base for both absorbing imported knowledge and for creating new knowledge. Nor has sub-Saharan Africa, which exemplifies the "weak South", remained stationary: over 150 universities have been established since de-colonisation began four decades ago. Research has become an integral part of universities, however modest the investment and output. Substantial stocks now exist of university graduates trained in a wide range of disciplines. Notwithstanding this achievement, in comparative terms, sub-Saharan Africa is way behind the "strong" South in investment and performance in education and research. As a result, sub-Saharan Africa still remains the "excluded" South in the global mainstream of knowledge absorption and production.

The challenges facing the new partnership in research vis à vis sub-Saharan Africa can be summed up in the following sets of questions:

\* What are the optimal ways in which local resources and donor funding can be used for creating and strengthening capacity and competence that form the base for advancing on

the knowledge front? What should the division of labour be between universities and specialist institutions outside the university system? What roles can regional and international research institutions play in this?

\* What can one learn from the experience so far in redressing the imbalance in the partnership relationship between hugely unequal partners? What does it entail in terms of the division of aid resources as between Swedish and African universities, the setting of research agendas and their relevance to African development problems, the ownership and control of research programmes and the crediting of research output?

\* How to design the partnership in a way that, on the one hand, minimises brain-drain from Africa, and on the other, mobilises the already existing and freshly created African capacity and competence ?

\* Is it desirable and practical for donors to coordinate their support within the partnership framework?

\* A good deal of knowledge in the North has been researched and developed with the help of public resources. Substantial parts of it are non-proprietary and ought to be available in the public domain. What mechanisms ought to be set up within the partnership framework to ensure that "public domain knowledge" is available to Africa either freely or on concessional terms?

\* Networking between individuals and institutions has emerged as a resource-efficient and relatively rapid way of strengthening capacity and solving problems. The networking process has expanded and accelerated due to the advances in information technology. How can bilateral partnerships link into international networking in ways that are beneficial to the goals set up for the partnership?

The future development of research partnership will depend on how seriously and energetically the above questions are addressed, and practical answers are found.

0-0-0-0-0

## THE WORLD CONFERENCE ON HIGHER EDUCATION: A FIRST LOOK AT THE REPORTS OF THE REGIONAL CONSULTATIONS

Sobhi Tawil, Graduate Institute for Development Studies, Geneva

The World Conference on Higher Education is to be convened in Paris in October 1998. In the words of the Director-General of UNESCO, Federico Mayor, the aim of the conference is to produce "a comprehensive worldwide plan of action, involving the international organizations that are responsible for training and development programmes. It should contribute to the renewal of higher education (...) guided by the three watchwords: quality, relevance and international co-operation." Preparatory regional consultations have been organized in Havana (November 1996), Dakar (April 1997), Tokyo (July 1997), Palermo (September 1997). The regional consultation for the Arab world will take place in Beirut in March 1998.

The first three have approved and adopted a declaration and a plan of action at their respective regional levels, while the Palermo conference did not. Rather, the European regional consultation adopted a document containing the results of the debates focusing on particular institutional problems faced by universities, outlining certain principles and indicating possible lines of action. The plans of action adopted by the Havana, Dakar and Tokyo conferences are based on the UNESCO Policy Paper for Change and Development in Higher Education (1995). The plans are presented around the results of the work of four commissions as proposed by the Steering Committee of the Advisory Group; that is, (i) relevance of higher education, (ii) quality of higher education, (iii) management and financing, and (iv) international co-operation.

As these documents are already the products of a consensus-building process at the regional level, they almost certainly do not reflect the wealth of the debates at both the national and regional levels. Indeed, the preparatory mobilization in the LAC region consisted of some 36 meetings at the national and regional level, involving over 4000 individuals. The dynamics of such mobilization cannot be captured in the final Declarations or Plans of Action. Moreover, the standardized way in which the results of these regional consultations have been presented does not significantly reflect the relative importance of different themes among the major regions. In this respect, a first look at the reports of the regional consultations is primarily informative of the main issues that will be contained in the draft declaration and plan of action for the World Conference.

### Relevance of higher education

Renewal of higher education and the principles guiding policy formulation are to be based on a vast array of concepts such as sustainable development, lifelong education, globalization of knowledge, preservation of cultural identity and values, contribution to peace, freedom & human rights, social & ethical responsibility and solidarity, transparency and accountability. The idea of merit and capacity as the basis for policies ensuring broad and universal access to higher education is accepted in all regions.

Linkage with the world of work appears most strongly in the Palermo consultation which marked a different approach from those of Havana, Dakar or Tokyo in that the debates were organized around 20 case studies based mainly on universities in Western countries. Relevance of higher education was seen primarily in terms of linkage with the world of work, and of industry more particularly. However, it was also stressed that "universities should not base their long-term orientations on manpower planning, but on social demand". Both the Dakar and Tokyo

conferences proposed the creation of "observatories" at the national level to monitor changes in the employment market so as to allow universities to adapt their missions to the needs and constraints of the local, national, and regional environments. This was perceived as being particularly important in Dakar in order to ensure that African universities do not in fact "become obstacles to development". Moreover, the Tokyo plan of action recommended that diversified partners "encourage institutions of higher education to foster incubator projects which help create new enterprises".

After having recalled the persistence of the problems of hunger, poverty, unemployment, illiteracy, the debt burden, armed conflict and environmental degradation, and after having highlighted the profound societal changes taking place in Africa, the Dakar conference recommended "that research be made to bear a close relation to the needs of African societies, so that basic research can be more closely linked with applied and development-oriented research stressing genuine partnerships with public and private institutions and the civil society. This would be one way of ensuring the active involvement of higher institutions in societal development efforts".

#### Management and financing

The diversification of funding sources, although perceived as crucial, continues to provoke debate and there is a strong feeling that public support remains important. The Dakar conference urged international organizations such as UNESCO to contribute in sensitizing political and financial authorities to the need for investment in higher education. Despite the prevailing financial crisis, the Dakar conference stressed the fact that the management of higher education cannot be reduced to economic criteria as proposed by technocrats, but must incorporate criteria based on principles of equity (especially for women and ethnic minorities) and of social relevance. In encouraging the diversification of funding sources through various income-generating activities (contract research, short-term courses, academic and cultural services...), the Tokyo conference recalled that "public support to higher education remains essential to ensure its educational, social and institutional missions".

The necessity of using new information and communication technologies is accepted. The need was expressed for investment in "information culture" not only for the improvement of learning and research, but also the management of higher education institutions.

#### Quality in higher education

The need for a culture of assessment, or a "culture of evaluation", in order to ensure quality is now no longer contested, although debate remains on who should conduct such evaluations and what methods should be used. The Dakar conference suggested that each Member State set up a mechanism for the evaluation of the quality of higher education institutions which "should be a control rather than punitive mechanism".

In order to ensure both continued high quality of research and given increasing concerns for adequate public funding, the Palermo conference suggested that "research funding allocations should be based on quality criteria and transparent auditing procedures".

#### International co-operation

The need for co-operation in the fields of training and research, including through regional and inter-continental networking. A particular obstacle identified in the way of promoting academic

mobility in the African region was seen to be the often heavy administrative procedures in obtaining visas.

The Palermo conference promoted the idea of strengthening "support mechanisms at national and international levels to stimulate and sustain research groups in less developed systems of higher education (...) in order to support institutional development rather than exacerbating the brain drain phenomena".

O-O-O-O-O

## UNIVERSITIES IN AFRICA: A REPORT FROM THE FRONT LINE

David Court, Rockefeller Foundation, Nairobi

[Excerpt from a presentation to a Bellagio Meeting July 15 1997]

Most universities in Africa are still in a coping or damage limitation mode, but it is possible that coping strategies contain the seeds for a stronger, more robust model. I think that there are trends, developments, ingredients, and outcomes which foreshadow a new pattern or patterns for HE in Africa. They are products of things happening outside and within Africa. Some are injunctions from the World Bank - if you do all these things, you will have a stronger university. Others really do seem to have an authentic quality of their own and are occurring within the institutions on the ground. The purpose of these comments is to single out some new trends and practices out of which higher education seems to be regaining some strength and quality. They can be characterised under three broad features a) 'new realism' (necessity), b) a willingness to take on diversity and c) greater autonomy from government.

### 1. New realism

There is a recognition that there is no going back to older, earlier models of universities - the high prestige or 'developmental' models.

a) At the top of the list in the new realism is the acceptance by governments and universities alike of the need for the beneficiaries of education, i.e. students, to take on a share of the cost. There are now 5000 private students in Uganda and 3 private universities. Bringing competition and diversity to national institutions.

b) Coupled with this is an acceptance in some places, such as Dar es Salaam and Mozambique, of strategic plans and more professional management systems for more rational use of resources - scholarship systems for the needy, reduction of enrolments, hiving off of welfare functions e.g. catering and residence, reducing proportions of non academic staff. Senegal now receives block grant funding from government via a national council for tertiary education.

This all amounts to a recognition that complex organisations need training managers. No failed academics to apply!

### 2. Willingness to consider greater diversity of composition and approach

a) New modes of delivery of higher education - polytechnics, and a broader use of distance education. For example in Tanzania there are ten times as many in distance education as in national universities; there is use of facilities at night.



b) There is a serious attempt to bring in women as faculty and students and to emphasise science.

c) There are new types of exchange programme, joint facilities with other institutions, sharing of faculty, sandwich programmes, making use of comparative advantage - e.g the MA training programme of the African Economic Research Consortium has been very important in getting universities to give up a bit of their sovereignty.

### 3. Beginnings of greater autonomy

An arms length relationship with governments (associated with spread of democratisation) has left universities with greater autonomy to sort out their own management. At the same time, political pluralism and more open societies in many African countries are creating an atmosphere favourable to academic freedom and more lively universities. Free speech, a critical press, public debate on issues, and a lack of political interference all help to create a climate where the basic function of universities i.e. intellectual discourse, criticism, peer review, promotion by merit etc, can exist.

In many places these are no more than mild tendencies but together they make up a degree of momentum. The changes are often mechanisms or modes of delivery. What still seems to be missing is a shared vision of what universities are for in Africa. For the moment we can be glad that the Cathedral does seem moveable!

O-O-O-O-O

## RESEARCH COOPERATION AND UNEQUAL KNOWLEDGE SYSTEMS

Berit Olsson, SAREC, Sida, Stockholm

During the fall of 1997, Sida was examining the importance of knowledge, competence and capacity within development cooperation. It started from noting that, in some fields, knowledge is developing faster than ever before and that information and communication technologies have dramatically changed conditions for disseminating information. This has created new opportunities. At the same time, an increased flow of information does not automatically lead to enhanced opportunities. "Transfer of knowledge" presupposes an active process, better described as "development of knowledge". The capacity to utilise knowledge and experiences from other parts of the world is intimately linked to the quality of a country's knowledge system.

As new technologies, knowledge and competence development are highly regarded in the developed countries, an increasing polarisation between countries has taken place. There is a tremendous difference between countries, with structures, organisations, and people with capacities to seek, choose and evaluate information, and with capacity to amalgamate external input, and other countries where these capacities are undeveloped. This is true, as well, for their capacity to transform knowledge into productive investments.

The erosion of national knowledge systems, capacities in basic as well as higher education and research, in some developing countries, are important in this negative development. Not only

does it undermine the capacity of poor countries to produce "human capital". Equally important, education as a human right is a prerequisite for development of democratic societies.

Against this background, Sida will review its methods for the strengthening of key institutions, and will propose to the Government substantially to increase its support for higher education and research. The strengthening of research development has been identified as a strategic input in university support. While Swedish universities allocate about 2/3 of their total budget to research (including external grants), many African universities spend close to 90% on salaries and less than a fraction on research. The Swedish support focuses on the development of structures for research administration, on infrastructures for research, like libraries, laboratories and Internet connections, and on resources for the implementation of research. Swedish research cooperation is seen as an input into a process which moves from sandwich based research training of university staff to research cooperation and support for supervision of national research training.

It is hoped that the research cooperation, eventually, may continue beyond the financing from development funds into jointly financed cooperative programmes.

As part of the ambition to reassert the importance of higher education, Sida is contributing to a new independent Task Force on Higher Education. The Task Force is Chaired by Professor Mamphele Ramphele, Vice Chancellor of the University of Cape Town and it consists of some 12 high level Members from different parts of the World, among these, the Swedish Minister of Education, Carl Tham, former Director General of Sida. The Task Force will have a first meeting in Cape Town in February 1998 and is expected to produce a preliminary statement for the World Conference on Higher Education, organised by UNESCO in October later this year.

0-0-0-0-0

#### SOME DRAFT POLICY IMPLICATIONS OF THE HIGHER EDUCATION SYNTHESIS STUDY

Kenneth King, Centre of African Studies, Edinburgh

[An excerpt from the Executive Summary of DFID's *Higher Education Synthesis Study*, (January 1998) with particular reference to DFID in the UK. For details, see Publications Section of this issue.]

A series of broader implications relating to the higher education subsector can be deduced from the synthesis study as a whole:

i. It is important to manage any reduction of aid support for higher education in such a way as to minimise the risk of damage to the institutional investments that have been built up. Low-cost linkage arrangements can be a useful way to consolidate support already provided and should be considered as an alternative to more abrupt exit strategies. However, although the UK's low cost linkage arrangements appear to work well in relatively better-endowed higher education environments, a different modality of co-operation may need to be explored in weaker, 'asymmetrical' institutional settings.

- ii. When considering how best to support basic education, the relationship with higher education needs to be considered. Without good quality university level training, the quality of basic education is likely to suffer.
- iii. Comparative advantage is one of the factors which must influence the shape and content of all donors' programmes, and in the case of the UK this may often lead to a focus on higher education. DFID should keep abreast of, and arguably contribute to, the work of the new Task Force on Higher Education and Society.
- iv. The double-sidedness of higher education co-operation implies that the UK's institutional capacity to advise, consult and research on international development priorities can be affected by a shift in focus within the aid programme from higher education to primary.
- v. Recent concerns with genuine partnerships in British (and Swedish) aid policy point to the importance of long term but sustainable commitments to capacity building in higher education.
- vi. From existing data in DFID's Statistics Department, it would be useful to lay out the changes over time in the location, distribution and character of higher education projects and in some of the key project components, such as British experts, UK based training and links with UK institutions.
- vii. The current mechanism of a selective synthesis evaluation may not be well suited to drawing out the operational and policy lessons from an economic sector such as education.

0-0-0-0-0

## NORRAG NEWS: A VIEW FROM THE JOINT EDITORS CHAIR, 1985-90

Christine McNab, Sida, Dar es Salaam

This is a personal and very subjective retrospective written in Tanzania without any files on NORRAG and not even any back copies of Norrag News to look through. My first contact with NORRAG in 1985 came after the idea of Norrag News had been developed by Kenneth King and his colleagues in the RRAG networks. The Institute of International Education (IIE) in Stockholm, where I was a research student, became the first of the partner institutes to share the work of editing, production and distribution with Edinburgh University. The Swedish International Development Authority supported NN financially from the first edition and continued to do so until 1997 even though the IIE stopped being actively involved in NN after 1990. I finished working on NN when I graduated and moved to Sida in Stockholm at the end of 1989.

I suppose I was selected by the Institute to work on NN because I was a mother-tongue speaker of English in an international institute and therefore assumed to have some editing skills. I also had a flexible enough timetable to be able to participate in RRAG meetings and spend some time writing non-research articles. Working with KK could be exhausting - he certainly had, and has, a lot more stamina than most people and was an insatiable hunter of information and persuader of people to write things. This was both an advantage, a lot of interesting inside information on the donor agenda for education and development, and a problem as it meant that NN could be extremely long, expensive to produce, and when free university mail was abolished in Sweden, very expensive to distribute. Our first, and continuing, disagreement was on the level of ambition and length of the journal. I lost the argument and it has been pretty much the same length ever since. Does anybody read it all? Would more people read more of it if it was a little less intimidating when sitting in the in-tray? These questions were never satisfactorily answered despite attempts to get such feedback.

Our other abiding discussion point was who NN should be distributed to, an issue which we did not resolve. Sida, as a funding agency and guided by Swedish law on the right of access to information, was in favour of wide dissemination. The IIE supported this view. As I remember it, KK was in favour of a more restricted access giving priority to members of the RRAG networks and contributors to NN. As long as we could afford to do so, the IIE sent out hundreds of copies to the Southern RRAG networks and to education institutions in the ERNESA countries. This practice was discontinued, as far as I know, after the joint editorship moved from Stockholm to CESO. The policy was also influenced by the subsequent registering of NORRAG as an NGO with subscribing members.

Did we achieve anything by producing Norrag News? I think we did. There was a lot happening at the end of the '80s in the agency world regarding education and development. The World Bank was becoming a dominant voice in the education dialogue and there was little access for education researchers in the South to World Bank draft documents and background materials. Norrag News was able to provide some information on what was happening. Similarly, the agendas of other development agencies could be made public to an audience, education researchers, which was not on the agencies' priority list for contact, feedback and policy development. When the preparations for the Jomtien Conference got underway, NN was able to provide a running commentary on what was happening, about to happen, and where, and thereby facilitated the participation of education researchers in the run-up to the conference.

From a personal point of view, editing NN was a welcome break from writing my dissertation. It gave me access to other academic institutions and to development agencies. I learned a lot about the international development cooperation agenda. I met people in the RRAG groups who are stimulating colleagues and I have remained in contact with them even after becoming an agency bureaucrat. Working with Kenneth was a learning experience which I can recommend to anyone. In sum, I gained at least as much from my involvement with NN as I was able to give back to the network.

O-O-O-O-O

## INSTITUTIONALISING NORRAG

Wim Biervliet, NUFFIC/DESC

Joint editor NORRAG NEWS with Kenneth King (1990-1992)

Even though not institutionalised, some referred to NORRAG as a clique, a closed circle of intimates; but there was an open dynamic in NORRAG before 1993. In fact, it is, and was, an open network of committed persons from research, policy making and donor agency circles. Such an open network, strongly based on voluntarism is by definition temporary and dependent on the willingness of a few to arrange for benefits for the many. 'The eyes and ears of the South in the North', as old-time RRAG persons referred to NORRAG, were substantiated on many occasions, for me as a newcomer in those circles (starting in 1990 as joint editor with Kenneth King) in very innovative ways.

Pre-drafts of the Jomtien framework for Action were commented upon by NORRAG related persons, in NORRAG country circles, Daniel Morales-Gomez (IDRC) and many agency staff commented in last-minute faxes and at Schiphol, an airport meeting was organised to reflect on the feedback by the Dutch circles. REDUC, ERNESA, SEARRAG, all were involved with preparing and implementing the RRAG panel at Jomtien. This shaped the way for a period in which NORRAG concentrated on donor policy analysis, especially on the commonalities and differences between approaches of the World Bank and bilateral donor agencies (TVET, education research capacity building, higher education, aid under review concentrating on conditionalities and NGOs under review). An attempt was also made to start with a RRAG (NORRAG-ERNESA) approach in monitoring post-Jomtien through attempts to arrive at collaborative research on shifts in donor agency and national government policies on basic education in Tanzania.

Bringing together researchers from different institutions in Europe to prepare a research design and linking with ERNETA (Education Research Network in Tanzania) proved to be both fascinating and cumbersome. Such an initiative should be repeated under better conditions because, according to me it still touches at the heart of the original idea of the RRAG.

Networking and editing of NORRAG NEWS proceeded in a way which was not very well known then, a consultancy mode, with consultants working without fees. Meetings were arranged piggybacking with larger events. Outlines of NN issues were sent sometimes three weeks in advance, asking people to react by fax. In NUFFIC and Edinburgh, contributions were retyped. Still, there was surprising interest in co-operating in this "quick and dirty" fashion and in the same way we succeeded in arranging for funding for members of Southern RRAGs from friendly agencies like SIDA and DSE.

The process was extremely valuable for all concerned not least because it established a personalised network as a basis for reciprocal access to information and other benefits which were until then accessible to an even smaller group of intimates and hardly accessible to people in the South.

Problems remained. To mention a few; too many consumers versus too few contributors. Even though NORRAG NEWS was distributed in bulk through the different co-ordinators of Southern RRAGs, further dissemination to our constituency remained cumbersome. Southern RRAGs were themselves starting with a process of institutionalisation, moving away from a built-in process of dependency on the North in line with overall patterns apparent in society at large.

Institutionalisation has contributed a lot to accommodating some of the problems of NORRAG. The open character became obvious, more transparency emerged in decision-making processes. Some other problems remained such as revitalising NORRAG country clusters; and the role of NORRAG in relationship to other professional associations/networks.

Still, NORRAG deserves much credit both in popularising the aid debate in education, in bringing different constituencies both North and South, agencies and researchers, together in a platform which is stimulating and rewarding.

0-0-0-0-0

#### NORRAG NEWS 1986-1998

Kenneth King, Editor, NORRAG NEWS

The intention of this short section by the three people who have shared responsibility for editing or co-editing NORRAG NEWS at different times over the past 12 years is to initiate a debate about the role of a publication that is neither a Newsletter nor a Journal. It does not pretend to be peer-reviewed, except in the sense that our academic and policy peers continue to want to write for it and subscribe. Here then are some insights into its current role and some questions about change and development:

1. NORRAG NEWS plays a key role in a cycle of different activities which reinforce and disseminate particular analyses. Thus, NORRAG NEWS has often been used in connection with an exploratory meeting on a particular theme, and then has led on to a published book. It is not uncommon for an academic meeting to lead to a conference volume later on. What makes NORRAG NEWS different is that the meeting and NORRAG NEWS reinforce each other, and the volumes that have emerged thus far have been within six months of the issue of NN or of the meeting. Examples:

NORRAG NEWS 10 was a special Issue on 'Education Research Capacity'. It led via a meeting on the same topic to the book *Strengthening analytical and research capacities in education: lessons from national and donor experiences* (Eds. Gmelin and King, DSE, Bonn, 1992).

NORRAG NEWS 12 was a special issue on 'Networking Education and Training'. It too led via a special NORRAG meeting on the same topic to a publication by Noel McGinn *Crossing lines: research and policy networks for developing country education* (Praeger 1996).

NORRAG NEWS 16 was a special issue on 'Higher Education: the lessons from experience' which followed an invited meeting on the World Bank's Higher Education paper (1994), and led to the publication by Buchert and King (eds.) *Learning from experience: policy and practice in aid to higher education* (CESO/NORRAG, The Hague 1995).

NORRAG NEWS 18 was a special issue on 'Consulting and advising in international education and training'. That too coincided with a special meeting on the same topic, in Leipzig, and then led directly to a book edited by Buchert and King *Consultancy and research in international education the new dynamics* (DSE/NORRAG, Bonn, 1996).

NORRAG NEWS 22 is on 'New trends in international development cooperation' and it follows directly from one of the main sections of the Oxford Conference of 1997. It too will lead to a book in July 1998 edited by King and Buchert *The new environment of international development cooperation in education* (provisional title) [UNESCO/NORRAG, Paris 1998].

## **2. Not articles but summaries; not abstracts but storylines**

Another part of the possible attraction of NN is that unlike abstracts (which are often done by someone other than the author) many of the short pieces in NN are written by experts in their particular field, and they put over a point of view in just a page or two of text. This means also that on a particular topic such as the present, there are not just 3-4 carefully selected articles, but nearer 30 different points of view. The result hopefully for our members who want to get a rapid overview of an issue is that NN should provide not only a starting point but also some opinions and perspectives.

## **3. Contributions from a great range of different people in many different positions**

Because the challenge from NORRAG NEWS is to make a contribution in about a page of A4, it proves to be actually possible, even for extremely busy agency folk and for academics, to make a contribution to the debate, when the production of even a short article of a more formal kind would be quite impossible.

## **4. In-house bulletin, based on a degree of shared commitment**

It may be accurate to describe the tone of NN as an attempt at structured 'conversation' amongst a network on particular themes. But that is possible because amongst many members of NORRAG there is a readiness to contribute to a particular debate. Possibly this degree of personal commitment, though a bit fuzzy and difficult to pin down, is rather a key element in the whole NORRAG process.

## **5. Old faces and new amongst the contributors**

Although it has some characteristics of a house journal, it also draws in new people each issue. A few of these new faces are doctoral students for whom their first ever 'article' in the public domain was in NORRAG NEWS.

## **6. A mix of people with professional interests in international education as well as in international development**

In most issues, we have sought to have an interdisciplinary approach, drawing on those who look at human resource development from many different perspectives.

7. The distinctive feature of NORRAG NEWS is that, almost like a weekly journal, it comes out just 2-3 days after the last piece arrives with the editor. This 'just-in-time' dimension of NN is probably also influential in persuading people to contribute.

8. The themes and special issues are ones which the members regard as important.

Whether it is NN7 and NN8's commentaries on Jomtien, NN16 on the Bank's Higher Education paper or NN17 on the EU's first attempt at an education and training policy, we hope that we have identified issues that are topical and important.

Questions about which we know very little:

1. Our distribution to the South has been reduced from the early days that Christine McNab describes. One reason is that there is for many of us a difficulty about receiving free things, and the executive has therefore been anxious to ensure that NN does go to networks and institutions that find the information valuable. The question remains: to whom should it be sent free?

2. We send it to network contact points in the so called South, but only if they tell us that they really want it. When it costs quite a lot to produce a copy and to send it, we are anxious to know there is an interested recipient, and, ideally, someone who also would like to contribute to the debates. Members will see, from their membership booklets, that currently it goes to 9 national network points for ERNESA, 9 for REDUC and 7 for ERNWACA. SEARRAG no longer receives NN, since it appears to have stopped working as a network. Members don't currently see that NN also goes to a good number of non-network contacts.

3. We would be interested to carry out some kind of evaluation or exploration of our distribution to the South. Amongst options that are being discussed are the targeted distribution to Deposit Libraries, in a small way following the pattern of IIEP; the idea of a differential rate for networks in lower income countries, and several others. If a NORRAG member would like to offer to be associated with this, it would be valuable to hear from them.

4. There is an ongoing debate about using the internet. Thus far, this has circulated around the attractiveness of the idea versus the need to maintain and administer an up-to-date site.

End-note: There is available with the Secretariat an historical note on *Norrag in Perspective, 1977-1995*, should people want to ask for it.

0-0-0-0-0



**CESO IS DEAD! LONG LIVE DESC!**

Rosita M. Van Meel, DESC, NUFFIC

It is a pleasure to inform you that Nuffic has established a new department: the Department of Educational Studies and Consultancy, or DESC.

All of Nuffic's knowledge and expertise on the subjects of education, educational capacity-building, and educational policy are now concentrated within DESC.

Three centres of knowledge within Nuffic have been absorbed into the new department. These are:

- \*the Policy and Advice Section of the Department for Human Resource and Institutional Development;

- \*the Policy, Studies and Projects Unit of the Department for International Academic Relations;

- \*the Centre for Studies of Education in Developing Countries (CESO).

In the services it provides, Nuffic has always tried to apply just the right mix of expertise and know-how. The practice of education, by its very nature, requires an interdisciplinary approach. It was therefore a logical move for Nuffic to combine its various resources in this area into a single department.

DESC can offer a helping hand in the following areas:

- \*the development of international policy and international relations, not only at educational institutions but also within organizations and government agencies;

- \*the internationalisation of education, from curriculum development to international cooperation;

- \*the improvement of education and education systems in developing countries and in countries in transition;

- \*the set up or development of open learning environments and distance education.

In these areas, members of the DESC staff not only act as consultants, but also conduct studies, organize special training courses and seminars, and give lectures. Any time it is necessary, the DESC staff can also enlist the expertise of other Nuffic departments, for example in the areas of programme management, credential evaluation, and communication.

DESC, like Nuffic, does not work for profit; the fees charged for all activities are meant only to cover costs.

Since January 1998, Nuffic has appointed Dr Rosita M. Van Meel, as the Director of DESC. Previously R. M. Van Meel worked as Senior-Project Manager at the Dutch Open University where her main activities concerned the use of ICT in distance education and the re-engineering of learning environments in Economics and Business Administration.

## Address:

Dr. Rosita M. Van Meel, MBA  
Kortenaerkade 11  
P.O. Box 29777  
2502 LT The Hague, The Netherlands

Direct-dial: + 31 (0) 70 426 03 07  
Direct-fax: + 31 (0) 70 426 02 99  
E-mail: [rvanmeel@nufficcs.nl](mailto:rvanmeel@nufficcs.nl)  
<http://www.nufficcs.nl>

0-0-0-0-0

**WORKING GROUP FOR INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION IN VOCATIONAL AND  
TECHNICAL SKILLS DEVELOPMENT**

Simon McGrath, African Studies/ISES, University of Edinburgh

This working group of development agencies was established in 1996 and is jointly convened by the Swiss Agency for Development Cooperation (SDC), the International Labour Office (ILO) and NORRAG. It seeks to promote better understanding across the development assistance community of the challenges involved in supporting skills development across the range of sites in which interventions typically take place. As well as sharing developments within the policies and practices of the agencies involved, the working group also has an interest in developments in research and in overlapping fields such as small enterprise promotion.

Two discussion papers were produced in 1997 reflecting meetings in Frankfurt and London. These provide brief but informative summaries of the priorities and activities of agencies as well as a commentary on these briefing papers and on major issues discussed at working group meetings. It is intended to continue this series of discussion papers in 1998.

The group has its historic roots in the bilateral and multilateral agencies of Europe. However, North American involvement has already emerged and one of the major current goals of the group is to expand its active membership to include agencies from Asia.

More information about the working group and the discussion papers can be obtained through NORRAG coordination in Geneva.

For the details on the two publications see Section X

0-0-0-0-0

## NEWS ABOUT OTHER NETWORKS &amp; MEMBERS' NEWS

We are ready to carry information of interest to members about networks they are involved with, or moves to new positions. For example people will have seen that Christine McNab has moved to head the Sida office in Dar es Salaam. Shortly, Alison Girdwood is moving to the Education Group of the Commonwealth Secretariat with responsibility for higher education.

We have been hoping to carry information about other networks in the next issue, and that would include updates on those that we know well, such as REDUC (which has a new coordinator), ERNESA and ERNWACA. But we would also like to feature GRETAf, with an article by Michel Debeauvais. Especially, as we shall be having the Annual General Meeting of NORRAG in Paris, it would be appropriate to carry information about GRETAf and other networks that operate in Francophone Africa.

Members who have not been in Edinburgh, and who are interested in Enterprise, Growth, TVET and their multiple interactions are encouraged to come at the end of May to Edinburgh. See the details of this event on separate pages of NORRAG NEWS.

0-0-0-0-0

## CRITIQUING THE METHODOLOGY OF THE INDIAN STUDY

Anita Dighe, Indira Gandhi National Open University

As a participant at the session on 'Economics of Adult Education' during CONFINTEA, one was struck by the findings of the Indian study on the 'Impact of Adult Education Programmes on Socio-Economic Development of Individuals and Communities'. This study was part of a larger study undertaken by the Regional Office of UNESCO in Bangkok. In the introduction to the four-country UNESCO study, the purpose of undertaking such a study was made clear. Due to globalisation, privatisation, structural adjustments and debt servicing liabilities, most governments were effecting cut-backs in the social-sector, more particularly in education but most definitely in adult education. Even the bi-lateral and multilateral donor agencies were tightening their screws on adult education. It was hoped that the country studies would provide an information and data base for the advocacy efforts that would be taken up during the Fifth World Conference taking place in Hamburg in July 1997.

While one appreciated the reason for undertaking such a study and strongly supported the need for such studies to play an advocacy role, one felt uncomfortable with the research design of the Indian study. This study had an experimental and a control design, with some application of statistical tests. But the findings of the study attributed such a range of positive changes to literacy that one could not but marvel at the wondrous effects of the Total Literacy Campaigns, particularly in such backward districts as Dumka in Bihar, Bilaspur in Madhya Pradesh and Birbhum in West Bengal. Some of the positive gains that were reported in the study were:

- there was a positive attitude towards the education of both boys and girls;
- the extent of gender disparity was significantly lower in the case of the neo-literates;
- the use of family planning methods was higher in the case of the neo-literates;
- literacy seemed to have had a positive effect on cleanliness practices;
- alcoholism and wife-beating had been reduced due to literacy.

One marvelled at the findings, with some degree of incredulity. If by participating in an approximately one year literacy programme, the husbands could give up their drinking habits and stop beating their wives, then one wondered why the poor women of Nellore district had to organise themselves during the anti-arrack (country liquor) agitation, face police repression and be terrorised by the goons of the liquor lobby who received political patronage. Likewise, one could not understand gender disparities in the Hindi heartland where paternal attitudes towards the education of girls are so negative. Similarly, one could not understand how cleanliness practices could suddenly improve when lack of adequate water supply is the reality of the lives of most poor people in backward districts. Or again, how family planning practices could possibly improve when male attitudes act as a deterring factor to their acceptance by their wives.

The problem with the study was that it did not describe the nature of the literacy campaign not of the processes and strategies that were used for people's mobilisation. There is enough evidence to show that an educational programme that seeks to empower the poor, particularly poor women, and education which responds to their needs and problems, that the positive changes have been attributed to literacy can be

noticed even among the non-literate adults. What then is the impact of literacy on people's lives? The debate is still inconclusive and the study has not helped to shed any new light on this issue. On the other hand, it has raised some methodological questions. While numbers impress and do have a role to play in an impact study, it is the process of becoming literate - the trials and the tribulations of the learning process, the highs and the lows of adult achievement, the examination of one's attitudes and beliefs, an assessment of social relations within the family and the community - that should have received attention in the impact study. Also, in the case of the literacy campaign, the fact that the campaign provided, probably for the first time on such a large scale, a forum for participation and dialogue, discussion and learning and sharing among adults, that should have been captured. The unfolding of the campaign through a process-oriented, contextualised study would probably have shed more light and would certainly have lent more credulity to the findings of the study.

O-O-O-O-O

#### EDUCATION FOR ALL - DOES THAT INCLUDE NOMADS?

Caroline Dyer, University of Manchester

The cumulative impact of globalisation on nomads' lives has been overwhelming; so much so that nomads all over the world are finding it increasingly difficult to sustain their livelihood (see Toulmin's discussion). Where they can, nomads may be turning to formal education as a means to assure their future; and formal educational provision may find it very hard to accommodate them. They present a particular challenge to the notion of Education for All.

Our recent ESRC-sponsored project, Literacy for Nomads, illustrated some of the scale of problems a very marginalised ethnic group has when it tries to make use of existing educational provision. Demand for schooling among the Rabari group of transhumant pastoralists has become strong in the last decade. It has arisen as a response to the rapidly collapsing ecology and industrialisation of agriculture which, coupled with other factors, are rapidly reducing the pasturelands and water resources they need. For as long as nomads pursue their traditional occupation, the basic and almost insuperable hurdle they meet is that provision of mobile services is generally non-existent. Since India has very large numbers of migrant peoples - not only nomads, but itinerant ironmongers, and seasonal labourers - the issue of mobile provision will be an important one, since it is now from such unreached groups that a major challenge to Education for All in the Indian context will come.

In present circumstances, making use of schools becomes a possibility once nomads have sedentarised. The only widely available schools are those run by the government, which to the credit of decades of effort, are now found in almost every Indian village. We did not find Rabaris contesting the content of the curriculum, since they send their children to schools specifically to learn a new 'language' (Bourdieu and Passeron's 'social' and 'cultural capital') which they cannot teach them from their own knowledge bank, which is oriented towards animal husbandry. However, along with parents from other groups who have not been to school, they often do not understand the

importance of sending children to school every day; they do not know how to support their children; and they do not know how to relate to teachers. Teachers, too, often have little respect for an ethnic group that shows a disregard for the behavioural codes of other groups. This mutual lack of understanding often makes for poor relationships with school staff. However, Rabaris note with regret - but also resignation - that their children seem to learn very little in schools, and that even after several years of attendance they still cannot even begin to read letters or bills. Few children manage to complete upper primary and drop-out rates are high: there are growing numbers of disaffected youths for whom the job to which schooling is expected to lead is not within reach, and who no longer see value in the values of their own ethnic group. Questions about the impact of schooling on the cultural fabric of the ethnic group also loom large for parents of girls, since women are viewed as the carriers of their culture. There is a growing trend for Rabaris to ask themselves "schooling for what" and, from the perspective of their experience of schools in present circumstances, it is a question for which it can be difficult to find positive answers.

Will India's externally assisted DPEP (District Primary Educational Planning) be the answer? It brings a welcome focus to the role of lower managerial tiers in the provision of quality schooling. It offers them an opportunity to exercise with imagination relative autonomy and discretion to deal with the certainty that even within a single Indian District there is enormous socio-cultural diversity, leading to a wide range of educational needs. The clientele best met by the urbanised curriculum is probably already in schools; the challenge now will be to attract, and retain, children from the social circumstances least akin to the world in which the overt and hidden curricula of schools are embedded - those from rural and ethnic minority groups such as nomads. District-level planning for primary education is an environment with excellent potential for small-scale innovations designed to draw in ethnic groups, such as Rabaris, whose presence contributes to the identity of each District. The Rabari case may remind all of us who are concerned with International Development Co-operation that for some groups - who may be relatively invisible - the problems of access to formal education remain unsolved. It may also remind us that our continued efforts to address the quality of schooling in remote rural areas are imperative if we are serious about using formal education to improve people's lives and life chances.

#### District Institutes of Education and Training: a comparative study in three Indian States

Reflecting its continuing commitment to assisting the primary sector in India, DFID (Dept for International Development, formerly the Overseas Development Administration) has recently awarded Caroline Dyer a grant of stlg 210000 to carry out research into primary teacher education in India. The project, 'District Institutes of Education and Training: a comparative study in three Indian States' will run for two years in the States of Gujarat, Andhra Pradesh and West Bengal.

India's 'DIETs' are relatively recent departures under new District planning initiatives, and were set up as institutes both to provide pre-and in-service primary teacher education, and to act as an educational resource for the District. Each District may have 8000- 12000 primary teachers. One of the project's main aims will be to facilitate and observe the process of developing critical practitioners who can make use of the nascent autonomy that District level planning offers, instead of the previously highly centralised system. The project will facilitate teacher educators visiting schools, reflecting on their findings, and adapting their training messages to fit in with their

analyses of teachers' needs. A second project aim will be to draw on these participatory, action research cycles to bring policy makers into closer correspondence with processes in classrooms, so that subsequent policy inputs can be tuned to known realities within the District.

O-O-O-O-O

## EXPANDING INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION -REFLECTIONS ON THE FIFTH UNESCO WORLD CONFERENCE ON ADULT EDUCATION IN HAMBURG, 1997

Rajesh Tandon, PRIA, New Delhi

All International Conferences organised by the United Nations System propose intensifying and deepening of International Cooperation, so does this Conference. What is the purpose of International Cooperation? What should be its meaning in today's global context? What are the mechanisms which make International Cooperation effective in accomplishing its purposes? This and many related issues were discussed in a special thematic session during the Hamburg Conference. My own views on this are briefly enumerated below.

### Purposes :

International Cooperation in Adult Education must have at least the following four purposes:

It should promote greater visibility and universal recognition of adult education and adult learning as an integral part of life-long learning in contemporary societies.

It should provide the possibility of improving the quality of delivery of Adult Education as well as the necessary institutional and human capacity for excellence in Adult Education.

It should promote and sustain greater commitment and policy support to adult learning as a part of life-long education and generate supportive political will.

It should contribute towards increased availability of resources, particularly to countries and regions facing such scarcity of resources.

### Meaning

The meaning of international cooperation historically has been narrowly defined to mean international assistance. It implies a one way flow of Aid which is normally translated in funds. This further implies transfer of funds from richer countries to poorer countries, from the North to the South.

In this narrow meaning, international cooperation, therefore, has historically been transferring all funds from the governments of the North to the governments of the south. In case of adult education and UNESCO-related initiatives it has historically

meant transfer of funds from industrialised developed countries to the ministries of education in the governments of developing, poorer countries.

Clearly, international cooperation in today's context cannot accomplish any of the purposes mentioned above in this rather restricted and narrow meaning assigned to it in the past. In its expanded meaning, international cooperation must be seen as a mutually beneficial exercise for cooperating partners. All partners engaged in cooperation must benefit from the act of cooperation. This benefit should be seen as enhancing their capacities to pursue their goals in adult education. In this sense, international cooperation should be a mutually empowering experience for cooperating partners.

The second issue is the definition of the partners. International cooperation must go beyond Government to Government and Ministry of Education to Ministry of Education cooperation. We know from our experience that adult learning is pursued in such diverse ways that all Ministries of the government in any country should have a stake in promotion of adult learning not just the Ministry of Education. Likewise, in the countries of the North and the South, there are a variety of other actors, other than the government, which need to be parts to such a cooperation. There is a wide body of grass-roots Non Governmental Organisations (NGOs) involved in delivery of adult education services. Private, for-profit providers of adult continuing education services should also be significant stake-holders in a cooperative arrangement. National, regional and international networks of NGOs promoting adult education as well as other sectors of development should be cooperating partners as well. Academic Institutes, Research and Training Institutions, Universities as well as institutions promoting Human Resource Development should also be viewed as significant stake-holders in such a cooperative arrangement. Trade Unions, Social Movements and other societal initiatives must find a place as co-partners as well.

Therefore, the expanded meaning of international cooperation would firstly go beyond the meaning of transfer of money from one place to another. Sharing of experience, information, skills is as important, if not more. Building mechanisms for mutual support and solidarity can go along with any international cooperation.

Secondly, the expanded meaning of international cooperation must include a wide variety of actors from the grass-roots to the national and global levels. This plurality of activities among the plurality of partners will provide a thrust and momentum to international cooperation that is necessary for accomplishing the purposes mentioned above.

Therefore, the challenge facing all those committed to adult education and adult learning is to find ways to make this expanded meaning of International Cooperation a reality.

O-O-O-O-O

**FOLLOW-UP ACTIVITIES TO CONFINTEA V**

Madhu Singh, UNESCO Institute for Education, Hamburg



The UNESCO Institute for Education (UIE) has proposed a Plan of Action in the follow-up to the Fifth International Conference on Adult Education (CONFINTEA). The proposal has been inspired by and developed within the orientation of the conference document "The Agenda for the Future" (AfF), which recommends the use of highly flexible strategies and mechanisms in the follow-up actions, and the use of existing structures, institutions and networks, as this would avoid unnecessary duplication. The aim is to make the existing machinery for action, co-ordination and monitoring more effective, and take into account the highly decentralised nature of adult learning, its diversity and large number of partners.

The UIE will essentially play a catalytic role in monitoring the follow-up, ensuring that Member States, NGOs and other partners are given the necessary support for implementing the "Agenda for the Future". As an international reference centre, the UIE will establish a co-ordination unit, working closely with different units at the UNESCO Headquarters, the Regional and Field offices, with the major UN and other multilateral partners, as well as with NGOs.

Four areas are being developed by the UIE as particularly relevant for follow-up to CONFINTEA:

#### I Monitoring, Information and Dissemination

The UIE will be actively involved in collecting information on activities, meetings, projects and policies, and creating mechanisms for information exchange and promotion of co-operation. While the general monitoring will be centred along the implementation of general policies and proposals resulting from the CONFINTEA, more specific attention will be focused on monitoring gender sensitive adult learning policies.

Information activities are being proposed at the UIE to promote the development of actions relating to the different themes discussed in the diverse workshops. This will require an exchange of information between the different UNESCO units and with the thematic networks. The CONFINTEA follow-up Home Page will provide a quick exchange of information. In this context also, the UIE Documentation Centre is leading the initiative for developing Network of Networks.

Five activities are particularly relevant to the area of dissemination. These include: distribution of conference documents, production of thematic booklets, use of press and media, production of a follow-up newsletter, as well as an annual report on CONFINTEA follow-up.

#### II Support for Policy Development

One of the main thrusts of the CONFINTEA will be national, regional and international policy support and creation of networking opportunities for policy development in adult learning. A plan and seed-money fund for policy support is expected to be established and administered by UIE.

Policy development is expected to focus on areas such as demand relatedness, on provision, complementarity between public and private roles, gender sensitivity,

recognition of cultural identities, production of relevant materials, promotion of intersectoral linkages, diversification of financing, and finally, evaluation and monitoring.

A number of actions and initiatives have been proposed by UIE in co-operation with the UNESCO headquarters and the Regional/Field offices: Some of these include support to member-states and organisations on special requests, orientation seminars, tailor-made documentation on experiences in different countries, backing innovative policy development, support to the production of quantitative and qualitative data, national round tables, and an update of the 1976 Recommendations on the development of Adult Education as a policy tool for Member States. A UIE-Fellowship Programme is expected to be launched, promoting specific aspects of policy design.

### III Regional and International Forums

The international forum will function as a consultation mechanism to secure the implementation of the recommendations of the conference. This international forum, proposed on an annual and rotating basis, will be preceded by regional forums, whose follow-up and policy review activities are to be looked after by the UNESCO regional offices.

A first regional forum has been proposed by OREALC for Latin America. Two other regional meetings concern the Arab States and the Caribbean region. In Africa also, a conference of Ministers of Education already includes a follow-up of CONFINTEA. Collaboration in the field of non-formal education is foreseen for Africa and similar processes are to be developed for Europe.

### IV Support to Thematic Follow-up

Concrete follow-up actions in relation to the thematic working groups held during CONFINTEA will be supported through existing networks, and monitored together with UIE. Follow-up actions, both governmental and non-governmental, include production of materials, orientation seminars, joint studies, conferences, dissemination projects, documentation, monitoring and exchanges. While some themes (such as democracy and culture of peace, indigenous people, minorities, literacy, gender empowerment, the rights and aspirations of different groups) are being followed up through concrete proposals, others (such as changing world of work and economics of adult learning) need to be developed further.

O-O-O-O-O



## NEW PUBLICATIONS

**A HANDBOOK OF RESEARCH ON EDUCATION VOLUME 1: TEACHERS AND TEACHER EDUCATION IN BOTSWANA**

Editors: P.T.M. Marope  
Private Bag 00330 Gaborone, Botswana  
email- marope@info.bw  
&  
David W. Chapman  
AED Washington DC

Publisher Lentswe la Lesedi Pty. Ltd.

This book is a beginning of a series on Research on Education in Botswana. The series will come out periodically and will pull together major studies in any selected areas in the field of education. The first volume took Teachers and Teacher Education as a theme.

The book is organized into five parts. Part one provides an overview of government efforts to improve the quality of teaching and teacher education in the country. These efforts are juxtaposed with research findings on the state, and improvement of teaching in the country. The point made in this section is that despite gallant efforts and high expenditures on the part of government, research findings constantly reveal the lack of improvement of teaching. The chapter explores potential explanations for this dissonance. It comes to the conclusion that the implementation of the government efforts and the non-programmatic approach to classroom research have contributed to the apparent dissonance.

The second part presents the historical development of teacher education and of policies on teacher education. Part three presents the general research on classroom teaching in Botswana. Part four presents research findings on the teaching of specific subject matters. Selected subjects include Setswana, English, science, biology, and mathematics. Part five focuses on the teaching of special education and of physical education.

Although the handbook focuses on teachers and teacher training, the real emphasis is on identifying strategies for improving the quality of classroom instruction. This is particularly critical, especially within the general context where most African countries, including Botswana are pursuing a double-pronged agenda of expanding educational access while improving quality. Recommendations are presented for improving both teacher education and research on teaching. Also critical are ways of improving teacher support mechanisms so as to improve instruction.

The handbook draws together the work of eighteen authors as a basis for informing national policy deliberations as well as school and classroom-level practices. It provides one more avenue for policy dialogue between researchers and policy makers. It also provides one of the avenues through which research could be disseminated. Too often, research findings are disseminated through reports that are accessible mostly to researchers. Or through government documents that are also mostly accessible to those who prepared them. Quite often findings communicated through reports and government documents quickly enter the category of fugitive literature, largely unavailable even within a short time of their publication. The handbook serves to give such findings a longer half-life and to make them more accessible to researchers, policy makers and practitioners.

O-O-O-O-O  
OTHER NEW PUBLICATIONS

Kenneth King

NEW JOINT PUBLICATIONS OF NORRAG, SDC & ILO

Members may wish to know that as a result of the first year of activities of the Working Group for International Cooperation in Vocational and Technical Skills Development (no acronym available!), there are now two publications:

1. *Donor policies in skills development* (Paper No. 1, 1997) Report of the Frankfurt Meeting of the Working Group (Nov. 1996). This looks, in a rather 'Norragish', shorthand kind of way, at the essentials of TVET policies amongst the following bilateral donors: Denmark, Germany, Sweden, Switzerland, and the United Kingdom.

2. The second paper of the Working Group has the same title, *Donor policies in skills development* (Paper No. 2 1997). It is the Report of the London Meeting of May 1997, and it contains analysis of the following agencies' policies: Austria, European Commission, France, UNESCO (Sector Studies). One theme running through the London meeting was the link between TVET and small enterprise policies.

Copies of both papers (average length 30 pages) are available from any of the three joint organisers of the Working Group. They were both edited by Simon McGrath.

NEW JOINT PUBLICATION OF NORRAG & UNESCO

The next NORRAG joint publication will be available in July 1998 and will consist of a series of articles that have been developed from versions first delivered at the Oxford Conference of September 1997. A whole section of that conference was organised around the theme of aid and geopolitical change. To these have been added some new papers from other scholars. The whole book is due to be available by early July, and at the moment carries the title: *The new environment of international development cooperation in education* (provisional title) [UNESCO/NORRAG, Paris 1998].

NEW PUBLICATIONS ON AID AND HIGHER EDUCATION

There is available from the Centre of African Studies a longer version of what is also available in early February from the Evaluation Department of DFID. It is what DFID terms a 'synthesis evaluation' - in other words an evaluation of evaluations. The topic is higher education, and the main focus is on the way in which many different bilateral agencies have been justifying their support to higher education. There is a good deal of recent material on North-South academic links and on North-South research collaboration. There is also an attempt to look at the context of British assistance to higher education.

The two versions:

### Centre of African Studies

Kenneth King with Alison Girdwood and Ross Ashworth (October 1997) *Aid and higher education in the developing world: lessons learned and lessons to be learned* Occasional Paper no 67, African Studies, University of Edinburgh (ISSN 1363-0342) pages - 111 (See listing at back of NN22 for ordering details.)

### Department For International Development

Kenneth King, with Ross Ashworth and Alison Girdwood (January 1998) *Higher education synthesis study* Evaluation Report EV 602, Evaluation Department, DFID, 94 Victoria Street, London SW1E 5JL (50 pages)

### Reminder

John Grierson's useful little book, *Where there is no job: vocational training for self-employment* is available from the Centre of African Studies or from SKAT (Vadianstrasse 42, St. Gallen, CH 9000). If you want to order it or get further details from CAS, send an email to : P.King@ed.ac.uk

0-0-0-0-0

### CENTRE OF AFRICAN STUDIES UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH PUBLICATIONS LIST

#### Conference Proceedings

- \* Urbanisation in African Social Change 1963
- \* Religion in Africa 1964
- \* The Transatlantic Slave Trade from West Africa 1965
- \* Conference on Joint Research Schemes and Recruitment 1965
- \* Markets and Marketing in West Africa 1966
- \* Processing and Financing African Primary Products 1967
- \* Theory of Imperialism and the European Partition of Africa 1967
- \* Witchcraft and Healing 1969
- \* Transport in Africa 1969
- \* Political Theory and Ideology in African Society 1970
- \* African Public Sector Economics 1970
- \* The Exploration of Africa in the 18th and 19th Centuries 1971
- \* Development Trends in Kenya 1972
- \* David Livingstone and Africa 1973
- \* Tourism and the Management of Related Resources 1974
- \* Education and Community in Africa 1976
- \* African Historical Demography Vol. I 1977
- \* Appropriate Technology in Economic Development 1977
- \* Mozambique 1978

- \* Religion and Change in African Societies 1979 £ 3.00 or US\$ 5.25
- \* The Evolving Structure of Zambian Society 1980 £ 2.50 or US\$ 4.75
- \* Post-Independence Sudan 1981
- \* African Historical Demography Vol. II 1981
- \* Southern African Studies: Retrospect and Prospect 1983 £ 6.50 or US\$ 10.00
- \* Malawi: An Alternative Pattern of Development 1985 £ 28.00 or US\$ 54.00
- \* Language in Education in Africa 1986 £ 9.00 or US\$ 15.00
- \* African Medicine in the Modern World 1987 £ 5.95 or US\$ 10.00
- \* African Futures, CAS 25th Anniversary Conference 1988 £ 12.00 or US\$ 20.00
- \* Botswana: Culture, Education and Politics 1990 £ 10.00 or US\$ 17.50
- \* Critical Choices for the NGO Community: African Development in the 1990s 1991  
£ 7.95 or US\$ 15.00
- \* Christianity in Africa in the 1990s. 1992 £ 12.00 or US\$ 24.00
- \* African Boundaries: barriers, conduits and opportunities 1993. Available under the  
Francis Pinter imprint.
- \* Gender and Environment in Africa. Perspectives on the Politics of Environmental  
Sustainability 1994 £ 12.00 or US\$ 24.00
- \* Ethnicity in Africa: Roots, Meanings and Implications. 1995 ISBN 0 9527917 0 6 £  
15.00 or US\$ 30.00
- \* Rethinking African History 1996 ISBN 0 952791 71 4 £ 16.00 or US\$32.00

**Occasional Papers - University of Edinburgh. Centre of African Studies ISSN  
1363-0342**

- \*1. The End of Educational Self-Reliance in Tanzania ? K. King out of print
- \*2. A Bibliographical Guide to the Study of Political Economy of Contemporary Africa. C.H. Allen  
out of print
- \*3. Education, Science and Technology Research in Eastern Africa. K. King out of print
- \*4. The Perception and Utilisation of Morama and Other Food Plants by the Nharo of Western  
Botswana. A.J. Barnard out of print
- \*5. The Capital Goods Industry in Africa: Present Situation and Prospects. M. Fransman out of  
print
- \*6. The Participation of the Female Working Class in Trade Unions and Labour Struggles in South  
Africa from 1950. Nomatamsanqua Nomvete 1984 out of print
- \*7. A Comparison of Smallholder Agricultural Development in Kenya and Malawi. Bill Tod 1984  
out of print
- \*8. North-South Academic Collaboration in Higher Education: Academic links between Britain  
and the Developing World. K. King 1985 out of print
- \*9. Can Africa Feed Itself ? D. McMaster 1986 out of print
- \*10. Making Aid Projects more suited to Local Needs. Desmond McNeill 1985 out of print
- \*11. The People's Republic of Benin 1975-1985: A Bibliography. C.H. Allen out of print
- \*12. The Present Condition of Bushmen Groups. A. Barnard 1986 out of print
- \*13. Manpower, Technology and Employment in Africa - Internal and External Policy Agendas.  
K. King 1986 out of print

- \*14. Response to Maendeleo - Changing Perceptions amongst the Pokot of Nginyang in a Period of Transition. C. Ann Muir out of print
- \*15. The Role of Research in Curriculum Development in Anglophone Africa. E. Ayotunde Yoloeye out of print
- \*16. Overseas Training for Development: an Analysis of Britain's Technical Co-operation Training Programme from the national and the donor perspective. K. King 1986 out of print
- \*17. Training for the Urban Informal Sector in Developing Countries: Policy Issues for Practitioners. K. King 1987 pp 54 £ 2.00/US\$ 3.50
- \*18. Telling Tales: Literary Perspectives of West Africa. Pauline T. Wangman 1986 pp 97 £ 2.50/US\$ 4.75
- \*19. An Evaluation of Research and Policies on Informal Sector Employment in Developing Countries. K. King 1987 pp 34 £ 1.50/US\$ 2.50
- \*20. The Politics of Workers Education in Zambia. D. Alexander 1988 pp 45 £ 2.00/US\$ 3.50
- \*21. In service Training in Zimbabwe - An Analysis of the Relations amongst Education and Training, Industry and the State. K. King 1988 pp 112 £ 3.00/US\$ 5.25
- \*22. Banking Regulations and Third World Debt Management. Thomas Lines 1989 pp 97 £ 3.00/US\$ 5.25
- \*23. Two Education papers - a) Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Kenya; The Movement towards a Comprehensive National System. K. King (1989); b) Education-for-Employment and Self-Employment Interventions in Developing Countries: Past Experience and Present Prognosis. K. King 1989 pp 38 £ 2.25/US\$ 3.95
- \*24. Correspondence from the Royal African Company's Factories at Offra and Whydah on the Slave Coast of West Africa in the Public Record Office, London 1678-93. Robin Law (ed) 1990 pp 81 £ 3.50/US\$ 6.25
- \*25. Women and the armed struggle for independence in Zimbabwe (1964-1991). Leda Stott 1990 pp 80 £ 3.50/US\$ 6.25
- \*26. The Early African Presence in the British Isles: An inaugural lecture on the occasion of the establishment of the Chair in English and African Literature at Edinburgh University. Professor Paul Edwards 1990 pp 25 £ 2.50/US\$ 4.75
- \*27. Negotiating Pregnancy: Women's Strategies concerning Marriage and Compensation among the Kwenas in Botswana. Dr. Anne Griffiths 1990 pp 42 £ 2.25/US\$ 3.95
- \*28. The Role of Northern NGOs in the Promotion of Sustainable Development in Africa. David Boyer 1991 pp 80 £ 3.50/US\$ 6.25
- \*29. a) Training and Structural Adjustment: Images from Ghana and Nigeria, and b) The Impact of Structural Adjustment on Technical and Vocational Education and Training Systems. K. King 1991 pp 52 £ 2.25/US\$ 4.25
- \*30. The Building of an Industrial Society - Change & Development in Kenya's Informal Sector (jua kali). K. King and C. Aboudha 1991 pp 105 £ 3.50/US\$ 6.25
- \*31. Building Capacities in the Developing World: A Review of Experience in the field of Education. K. King 1991 pp 75 £ 3.50/US\$ 6.25
- \*32. A Scottish Parliament and Overseas Aid. Kevin Dunion 1991 pp 88 £ 3.50/US\$ 6.25
- \*33. A Haven of Tribalism? Reflections on Ethnicity and Politics in Okombahe - A "Labour Reserve" in Western Namibia. Sandra Brown 1991 pp 60 £ 3.00/US\$ 5.50



- \*34. Unreconciled Strivings and Ironic Strategies Three Afro-British Authors of the Georgian Era; Ignatius Sancho, Olaudah Equiano, Robert Wedderburn. Paul Edwards 1991 pp 25  
£ 2.25/US\$ 4.80
- \*35. The Kalahari Debate: A Bibliographical Essay. Alan Barnard 1992 pp. 88  
£ 3.50/US\$ 6.25
- \*36. The Function and Financing of African Universities: A Review of Selected Policy Statements 1933 - 1988. Alison Girdwood 1992 pp. 54 £ 2.75/US\$ 5.25
- \*37. Two papers on Politics in Kenya: a) The Political Culture of Kenya pp. 13. b) Politics and Democracy in Kenya. John Lonsdale; Wanyiri Kihoro 1992 pp. 17 £ 2.50/US\$ 4.75
- \*38. International aid to Basic Education: Flows, Policies, Modalities. Roy Carr Hill; Kenneth King 1992 pp. 37 £ 3.00 /US\$ 6.00
- \*39. African Taboos and Science Education. Kofi Agyakwa 1992 pp. 24 £ 2.50/US\$ 4.75
- \*40. 'Democratic Renewal' in Africa: Two essays on Benin. Chris Allen 1992 pp. 50  
£ 3.25/US\$ 6.15
- \*41. Afternoons in Damaraland: Common Land and Common Sense in one of Namibia's Former 'Homelands'. Richard Rohde 1993 pp 73 £ 3.25/US\$ 6.20
- \*42. The Development of Workers' Education and Political Change in Zambia. David Alexander 1993 pp 29 £ 2.75/US\$ 5.25
- \*43. The Flight -Lieutenant and the Professor: The Road to Ghana's Fourth Republic (including election statistics). Paul Nugent 1993 pp 84 £ 3.25/US\$ 6.20
- \*44. Changing the Subject: Curriculum Change and Zimbabwean Education Since Independence. Simon McGrath 1993 pp 68 £ 3.50/US\$ 6.25
- \*45. "Breaking with the Past"? A Consideration of Yoweri Museveni's National Resistance Movement and of Social and Political Action in Uganda during its Government. Justin McKenzie Smith 1993 pp 51 £ 3.00/US\$ 6.00
- \*46. Social Relations in a Changing Southern Africa: Case Studies from Botswana and Namibia. 1. Social Space and the Politics of Difference in the Tswapong Region, Central Botswana. Prina Motzafi-Haller. 2. Settlement Patterns of Khoekhoe-Speaking Namibians. Alan Barnard and Joy Barnard 1993 pp 66 £ 3.25/US\$ 6.20
- \*47. Malawi Beyond Banda. 1. Options for Church and State: Now and Post Referendum. Mgr. John Roche. 2. Political Change and the Question of National Identity in Malawi. Mpalive Hangson Msiska 1993 pp 20 £ 2.00/US\$ 3.50
- \*48. Gender and Development: Research Methodologies. Edited by Gari Donn 1994 pp 67  
£ 3.25/US\$ 6.20
- \*49. Conflict and Protest in a Scottish Mission Area - North-Eastern Zambia. Marja Hinfelaar 1994 pp 50 £ 3.25/US\$ 6.20
- \*50. Participatory Local Research: A Namibian Case Study. Ruth M Nadjia 1994 pp 70  
£ 3.25/US\$ 6.20
- \*51. The Addis Ababa transitional conference in July 1991: its origins, history, and significance. Sarah Vaughan 1994 pp 79 £ 4.00/US\$ 8.00
- \*52. A socio-historical study of social change among the Bangwa of Cameroon. Vincent Lockhart 1994 pp 81 £ 3.75/US\$ 7.00
- \*53. South Africa and the International Community: Politics and Finance. 1. "Everybody Has Won, All Must Have Prizes" (Lewis Carroll) - Reflections on the South African Elections. Professor J Spence. 2. On Finance. Martin Kingston 1994 pp 28 £ 2.50/US\$ 5.00

- \*54. Creation Snake and Mobius Strip: the Mythopoeic Structures in Wole Soyinka's Writing. Ralf Hermann 1995 pp 49 £ 3.00/US\$ 6.00
- \*55. Basotho Religion and Western Thought. L.B.B.J. Machobane 1995 pp 57 £ 3.25/US\$ 6.20
- \*56. Education Policy in the New South Africa: Centre - Province Relations. Gari Donn 1995 pp 50 £ 3 00/US\$ 6.00
- \*57. Research and Development in Bushman Communities: Two Lectures. 1. Keynote Address, Basarwa Research Workshop, University of Botswana, 24 August 1995. 2. Culture and Development: The Case of the Bushmen, University of South Africa, 10 August 1995. Alan Barnard 1996 pp 59 £ 3.50/US\$ 6.30
- \*58 Tackling the Symptoms or the Causes? An Examination of Programmes by NGOs for Street Children in Nairobi. Madeleine Dunford 1996 pp 80 £ 4.50/US\$ 9.00
- \*59 Sounding out the Silences. Narratives and Absences in African Higher Education. Beth Cross 1996 pp 59 £ 4.00/US\$ 8.00
- \*60 Some Gendered and Occupational Aspects of HIV and AIDS in Eastern and Southern Africa: Changes, Continuities and Issues for Further Consideration at the End of the First Decade. Anne V. Akeroyd 1996 pp 90 £ 5.00/US\$ 10.00
- \*61 The Southern Funj of the Sudan under Anglo-Egyptian rule 1900-1933. M. C. Jedrej 1996 pp 21 £ 2.50/US\$ 5.00
- \*62 UK NGOs and sustainable development in sub-Saharan Africa. C. Ann Muir 1996 pp 21 £ 2.50/US\$ 5.00
- \*63 South Africa: Education in Transition. Gari Donn (ed) 1996 pp 93 £ 6.00/\$ 12.00
- \*64 A Short History of Wildlife Conservation in Malawi. Brian Morris 1996 pp 100 £ 6.00/\$ 12.00
- \*65 Fleeing the Jungle Bloodbath: the Method in the Madness. Judith Murison 1996 pp 88 £ 6.00/\$ 12.00
- \*66 Studying the Impact of AIDS in Africa Using Participatory Research Methods. Ambreena Manji 1996 pp 30 £ 3.50/US\$ 7.00
- \*67 Aid and Higher Education in the Developing World. Kenneth King 1997 pp 100 £ 6.00/\$ 12.00
- \*68 Household Methodologies and the Measurement of Incomes and Welfare in Tanzania: A Case Study from Dodoma using Interview Data. Ingrid Yngstrom 1997 pp 36 £ 3.00/\$ 6.00
- \*69 South African Art - a Story of Echo, Narcissus and Blind Tiresias. Two short lectures. Ricky Burnett 1997 pp 48 £ 3.50/\$ 7.00
- \*70 Africa: the Third Liberation. Mwalimu Julius Nyerere 1997 pp 12 £ 200/\$ 3.50
- \*71 The Policy and Practice of Adult Literacy Education in Ghana: From Vicious to Virtuous Circles? Kate McDonald 1998 pp 60 £4.00/\$8.00
- \*72 Where Seeing is Believing: Exploring and Reflecting upon the Implications for Community Based Natural Resource Management. Katrin Taylor 1998 pp 99 £6.00/\$12.00
- \*73 Relevance, Rhetoric and Reality: National Development At The University of Namibia. Brian Joseph White 1998 pp 87 £6.00/\$12.00
- \*74 And So To School?: An Experimental Analysis Of The Cognitive Sequelae Of Violence-Related Trauma For Children In 'Especially Difficult Circumstances' In South Africa, And The

Implications For The Delivery Of 'Education For Reconstruction. Abbi Wills 1998 pp99  
£6.00/\$12.00

The occasional papers are printed in limited numbers and are liable to become O/P during 1997. Some papers are already out of print; xerox copies of some available - prices on request. Most titles from 18 onwards are still available.

**James African Horton Memorial Lecture Series** - All £1.00 each.

These lectures are from an earlier series. Most are now out of print. The following are still available.

Race, Empire and Post-Empire - Christopher Fyfe (1979)

Traditional Technology, Rural Development and the Cultural Matrix: The Case of Sierra Leone - Dr C M Fyle (1981)

The Concept of Need in Adult Education: A Critical Analysis of the Notion of Responding to Needs by Educational Initiatives with Particular Reference to Adult Education in Sierra Leone - Tim Steward (1982)

The Concept of the African University: Horton's Dream and Today's Reality - Dr. A. Porter (1983)

Archdeacon Dandeson Coates Crowther: A Neglected West African Church Pioneer - Rev. Prof. E.W. Fashole-Luke (1985)

Tropical Forest: A Biological Cornucopia? - Prof. J. Grace (1986)

The Road to the One-Party State - The Sierra Leone Experience - Prof. C.P. Foray (1988)

**Directory of Expertise on Africa in Scottish Universities 1997** pp 80, £ 5.00

All orders will have post and packing added to them. All available publications are obtainable from:

Publications  
Centre of African Studies, University of Edinburgh  
Adam Ferguson Building, George Square  
Edinburgh EH8 9LL, Scotland  
Email: P.King@ed.ac.uk